

SAMUDRA

REPORT

THE TRIANNUAL JOURNAL OF THE INTERNATIONAL COLLECTIVE IN SUPPORT OF FISHWORKERS



CBD COP11

Fisheries and the Right to Food

Indonesia's Flying Fishermen

Subsidies and Fisheries in Chile

Fishing People of the North

Women Seaweed Harvesters



ICSF is an international NGO working on issues that concern fishworkers the world over. It is in status with the Economic and Social Council of the UN and is on ILO's Special List of Non-governmental International Organizations. It also has Liaison Status with FAO.

As a global network of community organizers, teachers, technicians, researchers and scientists, ICSF's activities encompass monitoring and research, exchange and training, campaigns

and action, as well as communications. *SAMUDRA Report* invites contributions and responses. Correspondence should be addressed to Chennai, India.

The opinions and positions expressed in the articles are those of the authors concerned and do not necessarily represent the official views of ICSF.

All issues of *SAMUDRA Report* can be accessed at www.icsf.net



JUAN CARLOS SUEIRO

SAMUDRA

REPORT

THE TRIANNUAL JOURNAL OF THE INTERNATIONAL COLLECTIVE IN SUPPORT OF FISHWORKERS

NO.63 | NOVEMBER 2012

DIN. M. SHIBLEY

FRONT COVER



Fish from the Sea's Edge
by Silas Birtwistle
www.silasbirtwistle.com

PUBLISHED BY

Chandrika Sharma for
International Collective in
Support of Fishworkers
27 College Road
Chennai 600 006, India
PHONE: (91) 44-2827 5303
FAX: (91) 44-2825 4457
EMAIL: icsf@icsf.net

ICSF BELGIUM OFFICE

Sentier des Rossignols 2
1330 Rixensart, Belgium
PHONE: (32) 2-652 5201
FAX: (32) 2-654 0407
EMAIL: briano@scarlet.be

EDITED BY

KG Kumar

DESIGNED BY

P Sivasakthivel

PRINTED AT

Nagaraj and Company Pvt. Ltd.,
Chennai

ILLUSTRATIONS BY

Sandesh (sandeshcartoonist@gmail.com)

FOR LIMITED CIRCULATION ONLY

SAMUDRA News Alerts

SAMUDRA News Alerts is a free service designed to deliver news reports and analysis on fisheries, aquaculture and related issues, on a daily or weekly digest basis, in plain text or HTML format.

The service often features exclusive, original stories on small-scale and artisanal fisheries, particularly in the regions of the South, as well as issues that deal with women in fisheries and safety at sea. Apart from news and stories on fisheries, the service also focuses on environmental and oceans issues. Please visit <http://www.icsf.net> to subscribe to SAMUDRA News Alerts.

BACK COVER



*Fishermen celebrating World Fisheries
Day 2012 in Abidjan, Ivory Coast*
Photo : Brian O'Riordan/ICSF



REPORT

Ecological sense..... 4

Ecologically and biologically significant marine and coastal areas were a key focus at COP11

CAMBODIA

A community future 11

A national consultation sought to develop guidelines for Cambodia's small-scale fisheries

INTERVIEW

Small-scale but important 20

Olivier De Schutter, UN Special Rapporteur, on his report on fisheries and the right to food

MYANMAR

A new beginning..... 24

A meet in Myanmar discussed the FAO guidelines for small-scale fisheries

BANGLADESH

A voice for the coast 27

A consultation was held in Dhaka on the proposed FAO IGSSF

INDONESIA

Flying fishermen 31

The fishermen of Lamalera, Indonesia, catch whales in a time-honoured tradition

VIETNAM

Small-scale hopes 34

A workshop on sustainable small-scale fisheries in Vietnam was held in Hanoi

REVIEW

Tug-of-war 37

Shifting Undercurrents reveals the problems of women seaweed harvesters

TIMOR-LESTE

Working together 39

A collaborative approach to counter IUU fishing is under way in Timor-Leste

CHILE

Fishing for answers 42

An assessment of the outcomes of government subsidies for small-scale fisheries in Chile

ALASKA

From the heart..... 45

Fishing people of the North face steep challenges in maintaining their livelihoods

SOUTH AFRICA

Improvident law 48

Legal improvidence has denied fishers in South Africa access to the waters of protected areas

COMMENT..... 3

ROUNDUP 50



SURESH ELAMON

Tuna fish catch from pole-and-line
fishers in Lakshadweep Islands, India

Right to Food

The recent report of the UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food reaffirms the crucial role of fisheries in food security

Environmentalism is a dominant theme in debates on fisheries policy, due to the looming crises caused by human impacts on resources and the environment. The report of the United Nations Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food, Olivier De Schutter, presented to the UN General Assembly on 2 November 2012, is, therefore, most welcome (see interview on page 20). In it, he reaffirms the crucial role of fisheries in contributing to food security, particularly for vulnerable populations and food-insecure regions. He examines how the most vulnerable sections can be supported in the progressive realization of the right to food, noting that a human-rights approach is critical for sustainable development in the fisheries sector.

The report is a useful guide on addressing the challenges facing the sector through policy responses grounded in obligations to respect, protect and fulfill the right to food. It recommends that States should *respect* existing access to adequate food, and abstain from taking measures that result in reducing such access. They should protect the right to food by ensuring that enterprises or individuals, like industrial fisheries and private developers, do not deprive more vulnerable groups of access to adequate food; and they should fulfill the right to food by acting proactively to strengthen people's access to, and utilization of, resources and means of livelihoods.

Making a strong case for supporting small-scale fisheries, the report urges States to refrain from measures, including large-scale development projects, that may adversely affect the livelihoods of inland and marine small-scale fishers, and their territories or access rights, unless their free, prior and informed consent is obtained. It calls for involving fishing communities in the design, implementation and assessment of fisheries policies and interventions that affect them, and supports the establishment of co-management and community-based schemes.

The report proposes exclusive artisanal fishing zones and user rights for small-scale and subsistence fisheries, and suggests regulating the industrial fishing sector to protect the access rights of traditional fishing communities. Noting the safety-net function of small-scale fisheries, the report seeks to keep fisheries "relatively open and free", and argues against

the introduction of transferable fishing quotas. It recommends human-rights impact assessments, involving fishing communities, before the conclusion of fishing-access agreements.

Highlighting the need to strengthen international efforts to address overfishing, the report calls for abolishing subsidies for fuel or boatbuilding in the industrial fishing sector. It urges a review of all other subsidies to ensure that they contribute to the realization of the right to food, both domestically and in third countries/extraterritorially.

On aquaculture, the report strikes a cautionary note, drawing attention to the continued reliance on wild-caught fish, fishmeal and fish oil in some

forms of aquaculture. It calls for support to sustainable aquaculture practices that benefit local communities and agroecological fish-farming practices, including rice-fish or rice-shrimp systems.

The report recommends "swift and wide" ratification of the International Labour Organization (ILO) Work in

Fishing Convention to improve working conditions on board fishing vessels as well as in the fish-processing industry, especially by improving safety, sanitation and hygiene standards, and enhancing social-security measures.

Lastly, the report welcomes the "important initiative" under the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) to develop international guidelines for sustainable small-scale fisheries as a complement to the FAO Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries. In this context, it seeks the active and meaningful participation of fishers' organizations in the preparation of these guidelines, consistent with existing international human-rights norms and standards.

While calling for action to address the severe and growing pressure on global fisheries resources, the UN Special Rapporteur stresses that options pursued, even when technically sound, must be consistent with the right-to-food and human-rights obligations of States. Policymakers and civil society organizations would do well to heed these recommendations. It is critical that negotiators get it right in the upcoming intergovernmental technical consultations on the international guidelines for sustainable small-scale fisheries.



Ecological Sense

The issue of ecologically and biologically significant marine and coastal areas was a key focus at the recent COP11

4

The 11th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (COP11) to the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) was held during 8-19 October 2012, in Hyderabad, India. Over 10,000 people, including delegates from 173 countries, United Nations agencies, intergovernmental, non-governmental, indigenous and local community organizations, academia and the private sector, participated.

The high-level segment of COP11, held during 16-19 October, focused on four key issues: implementation

the main goals of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020.

COP11 adopted 33 decisions. Apart from agenda items related to the status of the Nagoya Protocol on Access to Genetic Resources and the Fair and Equitable Sharing of Benefits Arising from their Utilization (ABS), implementation of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020, progress towards the Aichi Targets, and implementation of the Strategy for Resource Mobilization, other issues on the agenda included ecosystem restoration, review of the programme of work on island biodiversity, biological diversity of inland water ecosystems, protected areas, Article 8(j) on traditional knowledge, marine and coastal biodiversity, biodiversity and climate change, and biodiversity for poverty eradication and development.

...the most important focus at COP11 was on how to meet the Aichi Targets by 2020 and how to raise the resources needed to do so.

of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020; biodiversity for livelihoods and poverty reduction; coastal and marine biodiversity; and implementation of the Nagoya Protocol on Access to Genetic Resources and Benefit Sharing.

Following on the Aichi Biodiversity Targets reached at COP10, held at Nagoya, Japan, the most important focus at COP11 was on how to meet the Aichi Targets by 2020 and how to raise the resources needed to do so. The negotiations on financial issues were perhaps the most contentious, as developing countries sought greater financial support. Consensus was eventually reached at the eleventh hour, with developed countries agreeing to double funding to support efforts in developing States towards meeting the Aichi Targets and

Agenda Item 10 on marine and coastal biodiversity discussed ecologically and biologically significant marine and coastal areas (EBSAs); sustainable fisheries and the adverse impacts of human activities on marine and coastal biodiversity; marine spatial planning; and voluntary guidelines for the consideration of biodiversity in environmental impact assessments and strategic environmental assessments in marine and coastal areas. Most of the discussions revolved around the issue of EBSAs.

SBSTTA

Parties discussed how to take forward the summary reports prepared by the Subsidiary Body on Scientific, Technical and Technological Advice (SBSTTA) at its 16th meeting, setting out details of

*This report has been written by **Ramya Rajagopalan** (ramya.rajagopalan@gmail.com), Consultant, ICSF*

areas that meet the agreed criteria for EBSAs, based on scientific and technical evaluation of information from regional workshops that had been organized to facilitate the description of EBSAs. Parties debated whether to “endorse” the reports or to “take note of” them.

In the end, the compromise text proposed by the Chair, which avoided use of either term, was adopted. The Executive Secretary was requested to include the summary reports on the description of areas that meet the criteria for EBSAs in the repository, and to submit them to the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA) and particularly its Ad Hoc Open-ended Informal Working Group to Study Issues Relating to the Conservation and Sustainable Use of Marine Biological Diversity Beyond Areas of National Jurisdiction, as well as to Parties, other governments and relevant international organizations. However, the Russian Federation, Iceland and China pointed out that this was not in accordance with the procedure set out in Decision X/29,

which required the reports to be endorsed before submission.

The final decision that was adopted was welcomed by many, including environmental groups. It was felt that while the wording of the decision may not have been strong enough, as many had hoped for a more widespread endorsement of the EBSAs described at regional workshops, there was still enough in it for pressure to be put on UNGA to develop a legal mechanism for defining the management and/or protection of these sites in the high seas.

Several aspects are worth flagging in the decision that was adopted. It has been highlighted that the identification of EBSAs and the selection of conservation and management measures is a matter for States and competent intergovernmental organizations, in accordance with international law. It has been further affirmed that the scientific description of areas meeting scientific criteria for EBSAs and other relevant criteria is an open

IISD / EARTH NEGOTIATIONS BULLETIN



Ryu Matsumoto, former Minister of Environment, Japan, and Hoshino Kazuaki, Representative of the Minister of Environment, Japan, hand over the gavel and COP Presidency to Jayanthi Natarajan, Minister of Environment and Forests, India

Box 1

World Forum of Fisher Peoples (WFFP) and International Collective in Support of Fishworkers (ICSF)

11th Conference of Parties to the CBD
8-19 October 2012

Statement On Agenda Item 10: Marine and Coastal Biodiversity

Thank you, Chair,


The World Forum of Fisher Peoples (WFFP) and the International Collective in Support of Fishworkers (ICSF) would like to highlight the concerns of small-scale and artisanal fishers from different parts of the world on this agenda item.

The need to integrate the traditional knowledge of indigenous peoples and local communities and to ensure their full and effective participation in the implementation of the Convention is well recognized, including in the various decisions of the Conference of Parties to the CBD. However it is unfortunate that these foundational principles have not been taken into account in the various processes initiated for the description of Ecologically or Biologically Significant Marine and Coastal Areas (EBSAs).

We ask Parties to ensure that all work related to the description of EBSAs integrates the traditional, scientific, technical and technological knowledge of indigenous peoples and local communities, consistent with Article 8 (j) and 10 (c). We further request Parties to ensure that there is full and effective participation of indigenous

peoples and local communities, particularly fishing communities, in future regional and national workshops on EBSAs.

In this context we welcome the recommendations from the study on Identifying specific elements for integrating the traditional, scientific, technical and technological knowledge of indigenous and local communities, and social and cultural criteria and other aspects for the application of scientific criteria for identification of EBSAs as well as the establishment and management of marine protected areas (UNEP/CBD/SBSTTA/16/INF/10).

We urge Parties to take note of recommendations of this study and to develop socio-cultural criteria for EBSAs to be used alongside the existing scientific criteria, particularly in areas with pre-existing human populations/ uses, recognizing that the eventual management of the identified areas will be dependent on social, economic and cultural factors. Such an approach, which also takes cognizance of existing rights of indigenous peoples and local communities and their systems of governance, will have benefits for both biodiversity and livelihoods. 

and evolving process that should be continued to allow ongoing improvement and updating as improved scientific and technical information becomes available in each region.

The discussion also saw some Parties stressing the importance

of traditional knowledge and the participation of indigenous peoples and local communities (IPLCs) in the EBSA process. The Philippines highlighted the importance of ensuring the participation of IPLCs in the EBSA process and in identifying conservation and

management measures. This was supported by Mexico and El Salvador. Morocco called for paying attention to traditional knowledge to be used to overcome the impediment of insufficient data and absence of information. Brazil called for indigenous peoples and local communities to be involved in developing appropriate management practices.

The International Indigenous Forum on Biodiversity (IIFB) emphasized the need to ensure full and effective participation of IPLCs in the programme of work on coastal and marine biodiversity, including in expert and regional workshops, and in the description, identification and management of EBSAs. IIFB further urged Parties to ensure that description of EBSAs is based on the traditional knowledge of indigenous peoples.

The World Forum of Fisher Peoples (WFFP) and the International Collective in Support of Fishworkers (ICSF), in their joint statement, welcomed the recommendations from the study on “Identifying specific elements for integrating the traditional, scientific, technical and technological knowledge of indigenous and local communities, and social and cultural criteria and other aspects for the application of scientific criteria for identification of

EBSAs as well as the establishment and management of marine protected areas (MPAs)” (see Box 1). They called for the development of socio-cultural criteria for EBSAs that are to be used along with scientific criteria, particularly in areas with pre-existing human populations/uses.

In relation to IPLCs, the following directions in the decision (XI/17) adopted are important:

- Facilitate, as appropriate, the participation of indigenous and local communities in additional regional or sub-regional workshops for description of areas that meet the criteria for EBSAs for the remaining regions or sub-regions where Parties wish workshops to be held, and for the further description of the areas already described where new information becomes available.
- Further refine the EBSA training manual and modules, including through more consultation with Parties and indigenous and local communities, and develop training materials on the use of traditional knowledge.
- Make use of the best available scientific and technical knowledge, including relevant traditional knowledge, as the basis for the description of areas that meet the criteria for EBSAs.
- Make use of, as appropriate and relevant, additional social and

BONA BEDING



In deciding how to take forward the summary reports prepared by the SBSTTA on criteria for EBSAs, a compromise text proposed by the Chair was finally adopted at COP11

Box 2

Solving the Puzzle

A side event organized by ICSF and WWFP, titled "Solving the Puzzle: Social and Cultural Dimensions of Marine and Coastal Protected Areas, was held on 11 October 2012. It opened with the award-winning documentary directed by Rita Banerji, "Shifting Undercurrents—Seaweed Collectors of the Gulf of Mannar".

The film tracks the issues face by the seaweed collectors of the Mannar region due to the declaration of the area as a marine national park. Following the film screening, Lakshmi, a seaweed collector from Ramanathapuram district of Tamil Nadu, spoke eloquently about the problems they face. "The central government has handed over the area to the forest department for conservation, and have denied us permission to enter the area. But why will we ever destroy something that is the source of our livelihoods?", she wondered. Lakshmi pointed out another popular misconception: "Seaweeds do not grow on live corals; they only grow on dead ones. Moreover, we get injured if we go near live corals, and even our boats get damaged. We are not responsible for their decline." Lakshmi's statement puts paid to accusations that seaweed collectors are harming the biodiversity of the region.


Lakshmi's experience was echoed in the narratives of speakers from around the world. An exposition of an ICSF study on Costa Rica, Nicaragua, Panama and Honduras, shed light on the process, and social impact, of marine conservation in these four countries. Vivienne Solis Rivera, who conducted the study, said, "The cost of conservation has fallen on the shoulders of local communities, coastal fishers and indigenous peoples."

Riza Damanik of the Indonesia-based non-governmental organization (NGO) KIARA, which works among coastal

communities, said: "The Indonesian government has set a target of bringing 20 mn ha of marine area under conservation by 2020. It has already covered 15 mn ha since 2009." Fishing communities in the country are regularly subject to harassment for entering national parks, he added. Damanik listed the names of 13 fishermen who have been shot dead by guards since 1980.

Donovan van der Heyden from South Africa painted a similar picture. He likened the present form of marine conservation to the apartheid regime and called it "the second wave of dispossession" that has displaced communities and robbed them of their livelihoods. The Director of Coastal Biodiversity Conservation in the South African government, Xola Mkefe, who attended the side event, clarified: "All new MPAs strictly involve consultation processes with the local communities. We have worked with organizations like Coastal Links to know what the reality on the ground is, as the government does not have field-level resources."

All speakers agreed that top-down marine conservation efforts have often led to displacement of communities, and, ironically enough, have had few conservation benefits. Solis said: "These State institutions and authorities lack the instruments to work with communities, and have sometimes chosen the wrong approach towards participation."

All speakers at the side event had positive stories of struggle to share. Van der Heyden from South Africa drew attention to an ongoing legal case that has established a community's customary rights over marine resources. Seaweed collector Lakshmi's mere presence at the side event was testimony to her belief in the power of protest, even as it was a call for support. 

cultural information, developed with the full and effective participation of indigenous and local communities, in any subsequent step of selecting conservation and management measures, and include indigenous and local communities in the process, particularly in areas with human populations and pre-existing uses.

- Consider the use of the guidance on integration of traditional knowledge in the study prepared by the Secretariat, with the approval and involvement of the holders of such knowledge, in any future description of areas that meet the criteria for EBSAs and for the development of conservation and management measures, and to report on progress in this regard to COP12.

The above provisions are undoubtedly important for small-scale fisheries groups, given the existing shortcomings in the EBSA process. However, they do not appear

strong enough as they do not call for the development of socio-cultural criteria for EBSAs to be used alongside the existing scientific criteria, particularly in areas with pre-existing human populations/uses.

As with the previous COP meets, COP11 too saw a plethora of side events. ICSF, in collaboration with other organizations, held one on the social dimensions of MPAs and another on traditional knowledge (see Boxes 2 and 3).

IISD / EARTH NEGOTIATIONS BULLETIN



View of the closing plenary in session, presided by COP11 President, Jayanthi Natarajan, Minister of Environment and Forests, India

Box 3

Traditional Knowledge

The side event on “Traditional Knowledge and Area-based Management Measures in Marine and Coastal Ecosystems” was organized by ICSF, the Indigenous Peoples' and Community Conserved Areas and Territories (ICCA) Consortium and the United Nations University.

The panelists at the session brought to the table an astounding variety of indigenous knowledge and practices. Grazia Borrini-Feyerabend of the ICCA Consortium shared the example of the Casamance region of Senegal, Africa. The indigenous Djola community considers the mangrove-rich estuarine ecosystem as a sacred grove and has set in place a system for its protection. No-take zones, as well as zones where fishing is permitted for sale in local markets, have been demarcated. As a result, fish stocks have increased, and species that were previously scarce have begun to reappear. Participants at the session pointed out the need to share such experiences widely.

Robert Panipilla from Kerala, India, spoke of the local fishers' rich knowledge of coastal and marine ecosystems. He described how their knowledge of undersea habitats has been used to map the intricate topography of the sea bottom. Such mappings, captured by artists, were on display at the side event. Panipilla said that the method used by local fishers to locate underwater reefs, known as *kanicham*, was akin to sophisticated global positioning systems (GPS). He also explained how local communities had co-operated to establish artificial reefs, in response to the degradation of reef areas by trawlers in the 1980s.

Bona Beding from the Lamalera community of Indonesia took the stage with a video about his village, which featured a local song as its soundtrack. The video captured the philosophy of the famous whalers of his community, who live as one with nature, taking only what is needed, and not abusing resources. As an example of this nature-sensitive philosophy, he pointed to how the villagers catch only male whales, not female ones, which are left to breed.

“The government needs to take into account what indigenous peoples are saying,” said Jorge Andreve, a researcher from the indigenous Kuna peoples in Panama.

The Kuna peoples believe that everything in nature is interconnected. Panama is a unique example of indigenous peoples governing their territories based on their traditional knowledge and community laws and rules. Western scientific knowledge is being used in conjunction with traditional knowledge to preserve land, coastal and marine ecological biodiversity, said Andreve.

Emphasizing the need to bring together traditional and scientific knowledge, panelist Ron Vave from the University of South Pacific, Fiji, provided information about locally managed marine areas (LMMAs) in the South Pacific, which empower local communities to manage natural resources. As with most other indigenous communities, the local populations of Fiji also have a spiritual connection with the environment. Turtles and sharks are considered as totem species, and local people have intimate knowledge about these and other species. There is need to build on local knowledge, culture and governance systems, Ron Vave concluded.

Anne McDonald of Sophia University, Japan, made a presentation on women *ama* free-divers in Japan, who are part of a matriarchal system. Women have traditionally governed their resources, passing down skills and knowledge from generation to generation. Over the years, advances in technology, such as the use of goggles, diving suits and oxygen tanks, have been carefully examined for their implications for resource health and exploitation, before being accepted or rejected. However, with climate-change-induced changes the *amas* are struggling to cope. “This is where scientific knowledge needs to come in, when local communities are hitting the limits of traditional knowledge,” said McDonald.

When the floor was thrown open to questions, many in the audience shared their frustration at the fact that traditional knowledge of IPLCs continues to be marginally recognized in CBD's programme of work on marine and coastal biodiversity, as in the EBSA process. Questions were also raised about the very local nature of traditional knowledge, and the fact that it is, at times, difficult to separate such indigenous knowledge from traditional beliefs and superstitions.

For more

www.cbd.int

Convention on Biological Diversity

mpa.icsf.net

Marine Protected Areas, and Local and Traditional Fishing Community Perspectives

www.cbdalliance.org

CBD NGO Alliance

A Community Future

A participatory national-level information gathering and consultative process attempts to develop guidelines for Cambodia's small-scale fisheries

Over the last two years, the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) has been facilitating a process of developing voluntary guidelines for small-scale fisheries (SSF). As part of this exercise, it was considered appropriate to initiate a few participatory national-level information gathering and consultative processes which would provide insights about the nature of small-scale fisheries in specific country contexts—how they are viewed by policymakers; how they have evolved over time; how they are governed; and what the small-scale fishers themselves think about their sector and its future. One of the countries chosen was Cambodia in Southeast Asia.

Cambodia has a vibrant inland capture fishery, a significant marine fishery and an emerging aquaculture sector. Cambodians are avid fish eaters. In October 2000, in the town of Siem Reap, Prime Minister Samdech Hun Sen made his now famous pronouncement releasing 50 per cent of the individually owned fishing areas in the Tonle Sap Lake, called 'fishing lots', from the control of the influential owners. He promised to grant the released area to the rural communities around the lake. He challenged them to take over the right to fish without fear and also the responsibility of caring for the resources. He surprised the fishing-lot owners, the fisheries administration and the rural communities with this radical action that is now referred to as the Fishery Reform of 2000.

A whole new social engineering experiment had begun in Cambodia.

This resulted in giving the fishery a greater community-oriented focus. Many laws and rules were changed and new ones enacted. The first Community Fisheries Development Department in an Asian country was started. The Community Fisheries (CFi) organizations were constituted with a law, called a Sub-Decree. Many governmental and inter-governmental development and aid agencies came forward to help the Fisheries Administration (FiA) of the Royal Government of Cambodia to implement this ambitious programme. Many non-governmental agencies

...there are 469 Community Fisheries organizations, with a total membership of about 127,000 spread across Cambodia.

took steps to assist the communities in their collective efforts to gain control over the fishery and other natural resources.

Today (2012) there are 469 CFi organizations, with a total membership of about 127,000 spread across Cambodia. The majority of them (430) are located in the inland fishery around the Tonle Sap Lake and across the banks of the Mekong River. A smaller number (39) have also been formed in the marine sector.

Historical factors

In the context of the above historical events, two factors make Cambodian fisheries particularly relevant for the FAO initiative in

*This article has been written by **John Kurien** (kurien.john@gmail.com), Member, ICSF, and **Kaing Khim** (kaingkhim@online.com.kh), Deputy Director General of Fisheries Administration, Phnom Penh, Cambodia*

relation to the development of the SSF Guidelines:

- Cambodia is the only country in Asia where, since 2000, there has been a conscious government policy-driven thrust towards 'small scale-ization' of the fishery through the creation of CFi organizations—a sort of reform from above.
- In an effort to create participation from below, Cambodia has been experimenting with new forms of local-level governance and institutional arrangements which seek to change the erstwhile individual access- and use-rights into community-oriented tenure arrangements.

In an effort to create participation from below, Cambodia has been experimenting with new forms of local-level governance...

Against this background, the project in Cambodia straddled three levels. At the local village level, participatory assessments of the relevance and role of small-scale fisheries were undertaken by discussions with a representative sample of the membership of the CFi organizations across the country. Person-to-person interviews and focus-group discussions were the tools used to gather information and data for what was called an 'appreciative inquiry'. The results of this exercise were then consolidated, presented and discussed thoroughly at three province-level gatherings to raise awareness about the merits of small-scale fisheries, particularly with respect to its role in food security, environmental protection and sustainable livelihoods. The results of these three meetings were then presented at a national consultation with the objective of formulating guidelines for a brighter future for CFi organizations in Cambodia.

One of the main outcomes of the 'appreciative inquiry' was

a socioeconomic profile of the membership of the CFi organizations. Men and women, young and old, are members. The educational attainment of the membership is low, and lowest in the coastal region. Though CFi organizations are fish-related, only a quarter of the members identify themselves primarily as 'fishers'. This self-identity, however, does not deter members from undertaking capture fishing, which, after agriculture, is the most important secondary livelihood activity of the members in the wet and dry seasons. Most members own some arable land (on which rice or other crops are grown); they also own the land on which they have built their homes. While the majority own fishing equipment, the number of equipment items per person is very low. Fish-related activity was a vital source of cash income for the members. The estimates made of cash income potentials of the members indicate that they are higher than the estimates of per capita daily income of the population in Cambodia as a whole.

The focus-group discussions (FGDs) conducted in each of the CFi organizations were intended for two purposes: to obtain a greater qualitative understanding of the changes that have taken place in their respective local areas over the last decade with respect to the prime objectives of the CFi; and, secondly, to discuss some topical matters and issues of future concern and to elicit views on them. These issues included child labour in fisheries; climate change and the environment; the role of NGOs; and threats to the development of CFi, to mention but a few.

Some of the key points emerging from the FGDs are enumerated below:

The significance of CFi as a people's organization with the significant participation of men, women and youth is beyond doubt.

1. If the prime objective of the 2000 Fishery Reform was to ensure that the rural communities of Cambodia obtain access to fish for food and livelihoods, then this objective has been reasonably

achieved. The 'fishery success' must, however, be viewed against the overwhelming and continued importance of agriculture for the members of the CFi organizations.

2. CFi have shown that people consider conservation to be the key to resource sustainability, and are willing to take concrete actions to achieve it. The role of women in promoting this achievement has been significant.
3. Illegal fishing carried out by individuals with backing from influential persons in society was one of the most important threats to fisheries in Cambodia. CFi Committees suggest that they should have a greater role and facilities in tackling this problem. Women play a crucial role in the moral economy of illegal fishing.
4. The roles of government officers of the Fisheries Administration and the elected members of the Commune Councils have been meaningful in helping to set up, and in the continuing functioning of, CFis. This interaction should be keenly fostered in the future.
5. CFi organizations were a major source for building trust and fostering co-operation in the community. This CFi function may perhaps be even more important than catching fish!
6. Child labour in fishing was, and is, prevalent. Boys are the ones who are involved in fish-related activities. However, in the majority of cases, this was largely to help their parents, and the children were not exploited. Working part-time, they should also be able to go to school.
7. The involvement of women in the CFi has given them a formal status and voice in decisionmaking. They have undertaken actions in the key realms of conservation, education, development and dissemination of information and particularly on the benefits of community co-operation.
8. There have been significant and strongly noticeable changes in weather patterns. Whether these impacts are favourable or adverse

depends on the resource activity in question. Flooding, for example, has positive impacts on fish production.

9. Non-governmental assistance has been, and continues to be, important for CFi activities. NGOs provide important support to CFi organizations, which the government cannot provide. However, the role of respected and resourceful persons and organizations within the village also needs to be considered and recognized.
10. Development of human capacity is still one of the key elements required for the CFi to flourish. Developmental efforts must contribute to increasing the participation of members in the affairs of the CFi, to enhance their livelihoods skills, and to ensure effective and efficient CFi management.
11. Keeping records of data and information is important for institutional sustainability. Data to estimate the fish catch of members of the CFi can be generated, if so required.
12. CFi have given people freedom to access resources, which has, in turn, resulted in the reduction of poverty and better resource conservation and management. The tenure rights of the CFi should

KAING KHIM



Representatives of Cambodia's Fisheries Administration, civil society, international development agencies and UN organizations, during discussions at the three-day meet

Box

GUIDELINES FOR A BRIGHTER FUTURE FOR SMALL-SCALE FISHERIES IN CAMBODIA THROUGH COMMUNITY FISHERIES

These Guidelines have been formulated as the culmination of a series of consultative processes held between October 2011 and February 2012 with a vast cross-section of members of the Community Fisheries (CFi) organizations in Cambodia.

These 20 points have been grouped under four important themes and are considered as the most important guidelines for making a brighter future for small-scale fisheries in Cambodia through the CFi organizations.

1. INTERNAL STRUCTURE

1. Strengthen the capacity and upgrade the general knowledge of CFi members using both the formal and informal education system and adopting both classroom and field-exposure trainings. At the same time, request the Ministry of Education and Youth to include the basic knowledge related to fisheries into the general educational curriculum.
2. Capacity building of the CFi Committee and youth members from the CFi should be undertaken as a priority. The focus of capacity building should be on practical livelihood skills, community organization functions, and fisheries resource conflict resolution strategies.
3. The democratic character of the CFi should be enhanced by conducting fair and simple elections to elect new CFi Committees as and when their mandates expire.
4. Strengthen accountability of the CFi Committee to CFi members. This can be achieved by having regular meetings, ensuring greater transparency in decisionmaking and also undertaking regular monitoring and evaluation of the quality of management and member participation.
5. Open up and encourage the active and effective participation of women and youth in the affairs of the CFi and CFi Committee, particularly in combating child labour in fishing activities.
6. Enable and equip the CFi to directly communicate and make contact with NGOs and other relevant institutions to support CFi activities

2. TENURE AND RIGHTS

7. Establish clear tenure rights for the CFi using the official Area Agreement. There should be emphasis on (i) ensuring good boundary demarcation and (ii) providing effective patrolling and facilities to achieve the same.
8. Encourage local people's participation to abolish illegal fishing activity by designating specific CFi members as patrollers and encouraging local people to provide information on the illegal fishing activities to them.
9. Any development plan or project undertaken in the demarcated fishing area of a CFi should be undertaken only

after consultation with CFi members and after making a clear study of the environment impact assessment (EIA) with the participation of CFi members. The benefits of such projects should be shared with the CFi also.

10. Provide a greater physical and legal role to the CFi Committee and Patrolling Teams in stopping, preventing and controlling illegal fishing activities, and support the CFi for appropriate facilities to achieve this.
11. Provide rights to the CFi to collect a fee for giving legal rights to migrants to fish in demarcated CFi areas.

3. ACTIVITIES AND FUNDING

12. The CFi should be transformed from a fishery organization to a livelihood-focused organization, keeping fishery activities as the core focus while undertaking income-generating activities.
13. Create a Community Fisheries Revolving Fund exclusively for the CFi and link borrowing rights of the CFi to their respective performance based on the following criteria: (i) evaluation of their fishery/ecosystem conservation efforts; (ii) effectiveness of their internal functioning and member participation; (iii) their efforts at controlling illegal fishing; and (iv) their efforts for prevention of child labour.
14. Provide financial and other support to establish small enterprise, ecotourism projects and other livelihood initiatives, giving a share for CFi members and, at the same time, reducing the profits of middlemen.
15. Encourage CFi members to pay their annual membership fees regularly.
16. Incorporate CFi plans into the Commune Council Development and Investment Plan, and connect the CFi with the village and commune safety policy.
17. Consider the flooded forest protection initiatives undertaken by CFi for community carbon credits under climate-change schemes.

4. INFORMATION AND NETWORKING

18. Establish a regular data and information-gathering system at the CFi level for fishery catch monitoring, and socioeconomic and ecological biodiversity data collection.
19. Establish a provincial-level CFi network forum to provide good collaboration opportunities for CFis in each province.
20. Disseminate to the CFi, on a regular basis, the laws and regulations related to fisheries, fisheries environment, fish migration, fishing gear, fishing techniques, and climate change that might have impacts on fishing.

be strengthened. Proper demarcation of boundaries and equipment for patrolling are vital to support the CFI. Provision of more credit for investment and expansion of service-sector activities like tourism and fish marketing are important and will result in greater benefits from tenure rights.

13. Migrants should fish in CFI areas only with permission and only using legal fishing gear. Payment of a small fee to the CFI for the right to fish should also be considered.
14. There are several serious threats to sustainable fisheries and to the CFI organizations, which need to be promptly addressed.
15. CFI have helped to alleviate poverty, and taught members the value of conservation and working together. But the major benefits of the CFI have only gone to CFI Committee members.
16. A menu of diverse activities is needed to make the CFI the institution of our dreams. One of the biggest challenges is enhancing leadership capacity.

The overall conclusion from this participatory assessment of CFI organizations in Cambodia is that after a decade of functioning, they have made good beginnings towards becoming true community-based organizations supported by the State and larger civil society.

Success is not unqualified, however. Yet, the information and collective views gathered, provide a basis to state with reasonable confidence that these organizations have made a difference in the lives of the membership in a multiple manner of impacts and achievements. The membership has unfettered access to more fish to eat. They spend more time in fishing-related activity and earn cash income which plays an important role in contributing to their living standards. The co-operation and sense of community between members, which has been fostered by these organizations, have yielded many social benefits. These include: building greater trust; a higher awareness and value placed on

conservation; a keen sense of being recognized as a collective; recognition of their weaknesses and lack of capabilities; and the urge and desire to make a better future. These are not mean achievements.

However, what requires close scrutiny is the sustainability of these organizations into the future, if the status quo of 2011 prevails. This calls for honest introspection by the State, civil society and, more importantly, by the members themselves.

The State needs to consider how it can move from being the initiator of these organizations to becoming a facilitator. This role of facilitation needs to be done without undue and overbearing presence. The State and its representatives (primarily the officers of the Fisheries Administration at all levels) must learn how to play the role of partner, not master, in a co-management process for the

...after a decade of functioning, CFI organizations have made good beginnings towards becoming true community-based organizations...

sustainable management of aquatic resources. The instruments (laws, decrees, etc.) which have given the legal framework for the CFI need to be reviewed and made more flexible and suited to the reality faced by the membership. Most important in this will be to consider how the CFI can become a multi-purpose organization catering to all livelihoods needs of the membership—particularly their agriculture and related interests—and not focus solely on the fishery. Additionally, a greater role for the organization in dealing effectively with the menace of illegal fishing must be seriously considered.

Capacity building

Civil society needs to continue its support to the CFI organizations and focus on capacity building of the committee and the members. Effort is needed to ensure that the

KAING KHIM



Focus-group discussions (FGDs) showed that, after a decade of functioning, community fisheries organizations have helped alleviate poverty

be simple, free and fair elections conducted at the earliest, so that the true democratic character of the organization is retained. The current committee members should take the initiative for this with the assistance of NGOs and the relevant officers of the fisheries administration at the appropriate level of governance (district, cantonment, etc.).

The above are only suggestions indicative of the broad contours of what needs to be done. Each CFI organization is unique in its local context. Each must, therefore, ultimately have its own plan of action.

If the State, civil society and the membership can work out how they will collectively and individually act to sustain the CFI organization, then there is a bright future for small-scale fisheries in Cambodia. This may be the surest route to ensure protection for the aquatic ecosystems of Cambodia, fish for all Cambodians and decent and dignified livelihoods for millions. Striving to achieve these goals is surely a worthy effort.

Three inter-provincial meetings (termed region-level workshops) were conducted to feed back the analysis of the data and information gathered from the members during the local-level assessment. They were held in Kampong Cham (for the Mekong region) and Kampot (for the marine region) in December 2011 and Pursat (for the Tonle Sap region) in January 2012. It is significant to note that for more than 60 per cent of the participants (representatives from the CFI organizations that participated in the local-level consultation and a few representatives from other CFI organizations which were not part of the sample), this was the first time in a decade that they were gathering together as representatives of their CFI organizations.

Summary presentation

Initially, a consolidated summary presentation was made by the Deputy Director General of Fisheries, giving the highlights of the local-level assessment. The focus was on the results pertaining to the specific region—Tonle Sap, Mekong and

whole membership begins to take ownership of the organization. In this matter, emphasis should be given to stressing the role of persons from the locality—teachers, nurses, religious leaders, educated youth, village elders, etc.—who can play a supportive role to give encouragement and friendly advice to the leadership of the CFI.

Non-government organizations (NGOs) that have their base outside the locality should adopt the concept of having resident village community organizers (possibly from among the educated youth in the community) who can animate governance and networking processes within the CFI organizational structures. They can lay the ground for building savings-and-credit schemes which will work on a 'group basis' and cater to the productive purposes of the membership. Provision of new livelihood skills, as well as greater stress on social and developmental village-level activities as a whole, must be considered.

The membership themselves should seize the opportunity to make the CFI a 'live and spirited' organization and take it away from the 'empty shell' status which it may stagnate into if the current trajectory is continued. Women members can play a significant role in making this mid-course correction. There should

marine—where the workshop was being held.

This methodology provided the occasion for the members to comprehend the manner in which their individual views were aggregated. It also showed them how these consolidated profiles of their socioeconomic status and the views expressed at the focus-group discussions provide material to policymakers for taking future decisions. Participants requested clarifications. They raised doubts about the meaning and implications of some of the conclusions. Where appropriate, corrections were incorporated. The power and significance of participatory assessments became apparent.

The culmination of the three-stage process was a three-day national consultation held in Phnom Penh in February 2012. The consultation was titled “Making a Brighter Future for Small-scale Fisheries through Community Fisheries in Cambodia”. It was attended by 159 participants, including representatives of the CFI organizations, the Fisheries Administration, civil society, international development agencies and UN organizations. The main purpose of the workshop was to share the full results of the earlier process and conclusions with a wider cross-section of stakeholders in the fisheries who could comment on the findings and, importantly, contribute to developing some key guidelines for sustainable development of small-scale fisheries in Cambodia through CFI. These national guidelines would then become a contribution to the SSF Guidelines being developed by FAO.

Four processes were adopted in this part of the national consultation. First, the report of the local-level consultations and the three region-level workshops was presented by the Acting Director of the Community Fisheries Development Department (CFDD) of the Fisheries Administration. The CFDD is formally responsible for the activities of the CFI organizations.

Second, there was a period of intense group work where seven groups, made up of representatives from all the various stakeholders in the fishery, discussed the report and formulated suggestions which could make up elements for the guidelines for the future of small-scale fisheries in Cambodia.

Third, a committee, consisting of elected participants from each of the seven groups, discussed and produced a draft of the key elements of the group discussions which were to form the basis for the list of guidelines and recommendations for making a brighter future for small-scale fisheries in Cambodia through CFI.

Fourth, there was a plenary discussion where the draft guidelines were read, discussed and endorsed, point by point. The finalized document (see box) was then approved by the whole plenary.

Following the presentation of these Guidelines at the National Consultation, the State Secretary of the Ministry of Agriculture, Forests and Fisheries, who was present at

The main purpose of the workshop was to share the full results of the earlier process and conclusions...

the consultation, officially endorsed them in his official closing speech. Given the complex governance and administrative system in Cambodia, this formal endorsement is a first step towards these guidelines—developed in a participatory manner—being taken up by the government and the Fisheries Administration for implementation.

As a first step to making these Guidelines more widely available, the Fisheries Administration will publish them in the next issue of its official journal.

Guidelines created

Though not directly related to the process of creation of these Guidelines, a week after the National

Consultation in February 2012, the Prime Minister of Cambodia announced that the fishing-lot licences in the Tonle Sap Lake would be permanently cancelled and these areas would be reserved as conservation zones “to protect the lake’s pressured wild fisheries on which tens of thousands of subsistence fishermen rely”.

This decision of the Prime Minister is basically a continuation of the 2000 Fishery Reform process which he set in motion. The future implications of this decision for the CFI organizations are enormous. They will now become the main institutional arrangement,

A three-year plan, which focuses on conservation and gives priority to strengthening of the CFI organizations, is on the anvil.

Both these orders contain recommendations which have been influenced by the Guidelines. These include the need for capacity building of CFI to enable them to participate more fully in the fisheries reform process; encourage greater conservation of flooded forests and mangroves; prevent illegal fishing; and strengthen partnership networking all levels.

In the light of all the above, and, in particular, the abolishing of the fishing lots, the Action Plan for 2012 of the Fisheries Administration is being revised. A three-year plan, which focuses on conservation and gives priority to strengthening of the CFI organizations, is on the anvil.

In the context of the FAO initiative to formulate SSF Guidelines, there are some important insights to be gained from the experience of organizing CFI in Cambodia.

- Initiatives in support of small-scale fisheries that are driven initially by concerns of the State can be turned around into genuine people’s initiatives, if participative, appropriate, and well-thought-out development and management initiatives are planned, financed and implemented.
- Long-term and secure rights to resources is a basic requisite, if small-scale fishers are to commit themselves to participative governance and management of the resources and the ecosystem in which it is located.
- Resource conservation is a key factor in the management of small-scale fisheries. Supportive institutional and infrastructure initiatives to aid conservation efforts of the aquatic ecosystem need to be envisioned as a central pillar of management efforts. Conservation must become a passion if it is to succeed.
- Good leadership is the bedrock of successful organizations for small-scale fishers. Few fishers may be born good leaders, but leadership can be cultivated by practice and training. Capacity-building initiatives that focus on developing leaders is an investment which

with rights of tenure and access to the fishery resource, which exist in Cambodia. The success of fish harvests from the Tonle Sap Lake and the Mekong River will depend on their initiative and resourcefulness. If the CFI organizations are to meet these expectations, many elements in the Guidelines endorsed above may have to be carefully examined and implemented.

Following the National Consultation, the CFDD also officially transmitted the Khmer version of the report of the local consultations and the Guidelines endorsed at the National Consultation to the Minister in charge of the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF) and the Deputy Prime Ministers who are responsible for implementing the abolishing of fishing lots.

In April 2012, the government issued two administrative orders. The first was on the implementation of the latest fishing-lot reform. The second was on strengthening and expanding CFI to manage the abolished fishing lots and fish conservation areas, and suppression of illegal fishing activities

pays rich dividends for vibrant and sustainable organizations.

- Women's involvement must be central to any effort for small-scale fisheries development and management. Women are a vital social, economic and moral force in small-scale fishing communities, and their participation in development initiatives must become a foundational input as agents for change and not just as an afterthought.
- Management plans for small-scale fisheries should become a central part of any fisheries development programme. These plans need to be developed with a clear and keen understanding of the local natural-resource realities and viable structures for the governance of tenure. The implementation of plans should be participative, with the fishers, the riparian community and the State each setting up key stakes to ensure its success.
- Financial support for a new and ambitious programme for small-scale fisheries development and management must be forthcoming from international donors and financial agencies that have appreciated the role and relevance of small-scale fisheries into the future. More than the size of funds, it is when funding becomes available in the form of partnering initiatives that is most likely to achieve the objectives


The process which has been described in this report was a facilitative initiative of FAO undertaken in close partnership with the Fisheries Administration of the Royal Government of Cambodia and the members of the CFI organizations to evolve a set of participatory guidelines for negotiating a brighter future for small-scale fisheries in Cambodia.

It was the first time since the Fishery Reform of 2000 that such an elaborate exercise was undertaken by the Fisheries Administration to assess the opinions of the members of the CFI about the past, the present and the future. The systematic and large coverage of the fishers, which was

attained through the local consultation process, was by itself an important achievement.

This initiative highlighted how CFI—an organizational intervention which was instituted by decrees and administrative orders—has gradually attained the potential of becoming an important local democratic enterprise which can transform the livelihoods of an important section of the rural population of Cambodia. Whether, and how, this will materialize in reality depends on the confluence of many factors like, *inter alia*, secure tenure and rights to resources; good and committed local leadership; proper planning; and adequate and appropriate funding.

It was an important historical conjuncture that this process of assessing the CFI was accompanied by the political decision for total abolishment of the fishing lots system in Cambodia and the consequent opening up of new possibilities for CFI organizations to play a lead role in the inland fisheries sector of Cambodia.

There may be influential opinions and adverse comments about the underlying rationale and top-down decisions which marked the initiation of the Fishery Reform that commenced in 2000. Be that as it may, it points decisively to the pre-eminent role which political process and political will have in supporting a commitment for small-scale fisheries. This is a key 'takeaway' lesson from the Cambodian experience. 

For more



[www.ilo.org/ipec/Events/National Consultation on Child Labour in Fisheries](http://www.ilo.org/ipec/Events/National%20Consultation%20on%20Child%20Labour%20in%20Fisheries)

www.fao.org/cofi/24008-0c5031a8f865bdf0baac62c1aac1a031b.pdf
COFI Report on Cambodia Workshop

www.maff.gov.kh/en/
Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Cambodia

Small-scale but Important

The United Nations Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food, Olivier De Schutter, answers questions on his report on fisheries and the right to food

20

What are the key recommendations of the report?

The report recommends a nuanced approach that addresses the huge threat of overfishing and marine degradation, while taking into account the importance of fish protein and fisheries-based income for many food-insecure communities in developing countries.

In regard to overfishing and the depletion of stocks, the report calls for existing treaties to be applied. The Agreement on Port State Measures to Prevent, Deter and Eliminate

industrial distant-water fleets across the world. Stronger oversight mechanisms must be attached to LAAs in order to tackle illegal and unreported catch, while labour rights must be strengthened on fishing vessels. Furthermore, the report urges the conclusion of LAAs only on the basis of human-rights impact assessments, to be prepared with the assistance of flag States.

In parallel to these regulatory challenges, more must be done to actively support the livelihoods of small-scale fishers and the access to fish protein of food-insecure communities. The report recommends five measures to achieve this: the creation of exclusive artisanal fishing zones for small-scale fishers and greater oversight of incursions by industrial fleets; support for small-scale fishers' co-operatives in order for them to rise up the value chain; the establishment of co-management schemes to manage fishing resources locally; the avoidance of large-scale development projects, for example, sand extraction, that adversely affect the livelihoods of small-scale fishers; and the inclusion of fisheries and small-scale fishers in national right-to-food strategies.

What is the relevance of the report to small-scale fisheries and fishworkers?

The report highlights the crucial contribution of small-scale fisheries to food security, and urges governments to be supportive of this sector and to work *with* small-scale fishers to co-manage fish stocks and marine environments. The report recalls that some 12 mn small-scale fishers operate in coastal and inland marine

...more must be done to actively support the livelihoods of small-scale fishers and the access to fish protein of food-insecure communities.

Illegal, Unreported and Unregulated Fishing—the first binding agreement of its kind, adopted in 2009—must be implemented, while taking into account the role of occasional fishing as a safety net in times of crisis for some coastal communities, and recognizing the essential difference between unreported fishing by small-scale fishers and illegal industrial fishing.

Implementation of the Johannesburg Plan of Action, which mandates the reduction of States' fishing capacities and the creation of marine protected areas, must be urgently achieved.

Meanwhile, attention must be paid to Licence and Access Agreements (LAAs), which govern the activities of

Olivier De Schutter (olivier.deschutter@uclouvain.be, srfood@ohchr.org) was appointed the Special Rapporteur on the right to food in May 2008 by the United Nations Human Rights Council

areas across the world, deriving vital income and dietary protein from fisheries in a way that contributes crucially to the food security of whole communities. Data shows that small-scale fishers actually catch more fish per gallon of fuel than industrial fleets, and discard less fish. The contribution of the small-scale fisheries sector tends to be obscured by national statistics because of under-reporting, particularly in developing countries.

The small-scale fisheries sector, therefore, is an extremely important, albeit undervalued, source of livelihoods, providing employment and income to millions of people, including women in the post-harvest sector. But it also plays an important safety-net function. In times of crisis, often caused by failing agriculture, conflict or recession, fishing provides important part-time or temporary income or relatively free food, and the increased price volatility of food commodities created by climate change and other factors could make this role played by fisheries even more important in the future.

The goal of the report is to reaffirm the importance of the sector, and the need to take it into account in food and fisheries policymaking.

The report advocates for a human-rights approach in fisheries. Why is such an approach important and what will it mean in concrete terms? How will it change ‘business as usual’?

Fisheries contribute to food security and the realization of the right to food in two crucial ways: directly by providing fish for people to eat, especially low-income consumers, improving both food availability and the adequacy of diets; and indirectly by generating income from the fisheries sector.

Globally, 54.8 mn people are engaged in capture fisheries and aquaculture, and approximately three times as many are involved in upstream and downstream activities (for example, fish processing, selling, netmaking and boatbuilding). Small-scale fisheries predominate

in developing countries, wherein most fishing-related employment resides. Industrial boats employ about 200 people for every 1,000 tonnes of fish caught, while small-scale fishing methods (used by 90 to 95 per cent of people in the fisheries sector) employ about 2,400 people for the same amount of fish. This greater labour intensiveness has led experts to conclude that the small-scale fisheries sector is particularly pro-poor. Women comprise about half of the global fisheries workforce, typically concentrated in the pre- and post-harvest sector.

Fish consumption accounts for 15 per cent of all animal protein consumed worldwide, and 22 of the 30 countries where fisheries contribute over a third of total animal protein supply are low-income food-deficit countries—and, therefore, among the most food-insecure. In west African countries such as Congo, Côte d’Ivoire, Gabon and Ghana, fish provide almost 50 per cent of a person’s animal protein needs.

A human-rights approach means ensuring that fisheries resources are managed in a way that remains sensitive at every stage to the need for the most vulnerable people to be able to either produce or procure food. This means securing the access of



Fish consumption accounts for 15 per cent of all animal protein consumed worldwide, more in the case of low-income food-deficit countries like Timor-Leste

fisherfolk to fishing waters, and ensuring that these waters are not depleted or degraded by overfishing, while ensuring that fish and other sources of quality protein remain available, affordable and accessible to poor consumers.

What this means in concrete terms is that current trends will be thoroughly reassessed, with a sensitivity to the access to food of the world's poorest. This could mean reassessing the pros and cons of aquaculture. Aquaculture may now provide up to 45 per cent of fish for direct human consumption, but as is the case for terrestrial agri-food

A human-rights approach can also help to ensure that the objectives of the Guidelines are not undermined by developments in other areas.

systems, food moves not to where needs are greatest, but to where purchasing power is highest. Such is the imbalance of purchasing power that the prices wealthy consumers are willing to pay for farmed fish make certain wild catch more lucrative as an input to this process than as an end product for people who would be willing to consume it directly.

The report has extended strong support to the guidelines on small-scale fisheries being developed by FAO. How can the process of developing and implementing these guidelines contribute to securing human rights and the right to food?

Small-scale fisheries, despite their very important potential as an entry point for poverty alleviation, are very often neglected in rural-development or poverty-reduction initiatives. Putting human rights at the forefront of the FAO process would help to ensure that these Guidelines do not fall into this trap.

Participation is a cornerstone of human rights. Free, active and meaningful participation is necessary to create ownership, sustainability and, ultimately, effective outcomes.

The participation of small-scale fishers is key in the management of fisheries, and it is also important that small-scale fishers participate in wider decision-making processes that affect them.

Participation is also key for the effectiveness of fisheries policies and programmes. Such policies and programmes will be based on better information, and they will be better designed, implemented and monitored when grounded on the meaningful participation of the fishing communities they seek to support.

A human-rights approach can also help to ensure that the objectives of the Guidelines are not undermined by developments in other areas: ensuring coherence across policy areas is a key tenet of human-rights approaches. Where fisheries are concerned, policy developments in the areas of trade, land use, water pollution, and the management of rivers, lakes and coastal areas can have a major impact on strategies aimed at securing the role of small-scale fishers.

How was the report and the recommendations received at the United Nations General Assembly?

The feedback received from the governments who took the floor during the debate was overwhelmingly positive, though the negotiations on the resolution of the General Assembly on the basis of the report haven't concluded yet at this time. However, the main impact of the report should be at the national level, in guiding States' approaches to the fishing sector; in the negotiation of the International Guidelines on Sustainable Small-scale Fisheries in FAO; and in the discussion that shall take place on fisheries as a source of food security at the Committee on World Food Security, which decided to put this issue on its future agenda. My reports are not the final word; they feed into processes, and they help frame the international conversation on these issues.

What are the dissemination mechanisms to ensure the report reaches a wider audience? How



Fish being sorted by members of a fishing village in Myanmar. The participation of small-scale fishers is key to the management of fisheries, according to the UN Special Rapporteur

can the recommendations of the report be taken forward?

It is my hope that civil society groups, particularly those uniting fishers, fishworkers and fishing communities, will play an essential role in disseminating the messages of the report. Over recent years, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and other actors have been commendably active in drawing attention to the perils of overfishing and marine degradation, and the public is now becoming more sensitive to these issues. Consumers and governments alike must refuse to accept unsustainable practices, and civil society groups must continue to make their messages heard in order to continue this process of awareness-raising. Under-reporting, and the fact that it sometimes constitutes an occasional activity for coastal communities in times of crisis, results in a situation in which the importance of small-scale, artisanal fishing is sometimes not well understood. I hope that this is gradually changing. 3

For more



www.srfood.org/images/stories/pdf/officialreports/20121030_fish_en.pdf
Interim Report of the UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food

www.srfood.org/index.php/en/component/content/article/1-latest-news/2543-ocean-grabbing-as-serious-a-threat-as-land-grabbing-un-food-expert
'Ocean-grabbing' as Serious a Threat as 'Land-grabbing' – UN Food Expert

A New Beginning

A consultation organized in Myanmar to discuss the FAO guidelines for small-scale fisheries proved significant

The consultations for the guidelines of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) on small-scale fisheries (SSF) have been rather extensive. In the case of Myanmar, they have also provided a possibility for the SSF community to participate in the process. It was also a first-time opportunity for the International Collective in Support of Fishworkers (ICSF) to interact with the fishworkers of Myanmar.

fishers were from the marine sector, there were a few from the inland fishery—nearshore and brackishwater fishers as well as aquaculturists, mainly from the MFF.

Having got involved with fishing communities in the delta region after the Nargis cyclone, NAG was ideally placed to do the organizational groundwork for the consultation. As elsewhere, the small-scale fishery of the delta is different from the fisheries of the two neighbouring regions. Since this was the first time the fishers of these regions were getting together, it was felt important for them to not only interact with one another but also to understand the specificities of the small-scale fisheries of each region. Hence the consultation shunned formalities and grand speeches and got down directly into serious work in the form of discussion groups. That was the pedagogy for the first two days—a series of group discussions followed by feedback at plenary sessions, concluding in responses from a panel of selected and representative participants.

The four sessions focused on the following themes:

- Definition of SSF
- Problems and challenges faced by SSF
- Legislative provisions for SSF
- Proposals to sustain livelihoods of fishing communities

Wider understanding

Through discussions and feedback, the entire group gained a wide understanding of the fisheries of the different coastal regions. While all the fishers are expected to obtain fishing licences, it was revealed that in one

...a series of group discussions followed by feedback at plenary sessions, concluding in responses from a panel of selected and representative participants.

The Myanmar consultation was organized jointly by the Myanmar Fisheries Federation (MFF), the National Activities Group (NAG) and ICSF in Yangon between 12 and 15 September 2012. It brought together 35 fishworkers (including five women) and their organizations from the three coastal States (administrative regions) of Myanmar. The participants also included 10 parliamentarians (including one woman) as well as non-governmental organizations (NGOs) like Oxfam, Green Earth and the Myanmar Livestock Group and the local FAO Programme Chief who participated on all three days. On the final day there were members who represented the State and national departments of fisheries and other concerned people from Yangon. The local press was well represented too. While the majority of the

*This article has been written by **Nalini Nayak** (nalini.nayak@gmail.com), Member, ICSF*

region fishing grounds were tendered out, leading to large-scale operations of fixed bag-nets that require the hiring of smaller-scale fishers to carry the catches to the shore. As a result, access to the common fishing grounds was limited for the family of the smaller-scale fishers who fish for subsistence.

Another issue was the control of fish catches by the traders who either lease out the fishing grounds or advance capital for fishing operations. They also control prices and marketing networks. Direct access to markets is another major issue as there are no cold-chain facilities and distances to the large towns are considerable. Although closed seasons exist, the coastal fishers complain that large foreign and other deep-sea vessels are not controlled, and they also fish within the inshore waters, raising conflicts with local fishers and limiting their fish catches.

The consultation found it difficult to concretize what actually comprises SSF. According to some participants, it only included the very small boats

using 8-hp outboard engines and operating in the nearshore waters. But there were also mini-trawlers and larger boats of 50 hp that carried catches of the fixed bag-nets, and others that used hooks-and-line and gillnets, all of which operated within the territorial waters and were owner-operated with hired crew. Why should these not be included in SSF, some wondered. Even as the consultation opened up an area of discussion, it will take time for some form of clarity to settle on the issue.

On the third day of the consultation, a larger group that included members of the fisheries department gave inputs, which were followed by presentations from selected participants of the earlier sessions. The resultant feedback proved to be excellent: A local parliamentarian spoke of the need to think anew of fisherpeople having social, political and economic rights. A local community-based organization stressed the right to organize, a right not yet institutionalized in Myanmar's legislative framework.

AUNG KYAW KYAW



The participants for the three-day workshop included 10 parliamentarians as well as NGOs, the Myanmar Livestock Group and the local FAO Programme Chief

Fishers articulated their problems. MFF outlined its role as a national platform for all fisher organizations.

These discussions pointed to the focus of future fisheries governance. From the discussions at the consultation, it appeared that Myanmar's Fisheries Department was handicapped in relation to fisheries as it had no mandate other than issuing and renewing fishing licences. No development programmes have been undertaken for SSF, and no details of fisheries budgets are available for public scrutiny. National budgets seem to allocate only the salaries

...it appeared that Myanmar's Fisheries Department was handicapped in relation to fisheries as it had no mandate other than issuing and renewing fishing licences.

present at the consultation showed great interest in understanding these issues and how governance could be made more democratic and people-oriented, given the fact that most of them are critical of how the military regime of the past has dealt with the national wealth and resources of the country.

In that sense, the Myanmar consultation was opportune. Despite the fact that the country has been under a rather controlled regime for the last few decades, the level of discussion at the consultation was in no way indicative of a lack of freedom of expression. Despite linguistic and ethnic differences, the overall atmosphere was one of positive interaction.

At the end of the consultation, the fishers and parliamentarians parted only after exhorting NAG to organize many more similar processes at the regional level to impart information to people so that they could organize themselves locally too. The Myanmar consultation was thus successful in highlighting issues related to SSF and in instilling a commitment to address them more seriously.

of departmental personnel. As elsewhere in the region, aquaculture in Myanmar—both brackish- and freshwater—is gaining importance, but there was not much discussion on the issue at the consultation.

NAG made two presentations on the history of fishing rights in Myanmar, which revealed the new framework required for governance of fisheries. On behalf of ICSF, this writer presented the FAO process for the SSF guidelines, which received positive responses, since most of the participants had not yet heard about them. The presentation was followed by a lively panel discussion on questions that emerged from the floor.

Since the 2011 elections, Myanmar has been going through a process of democratization. Since fisheries is a district/regional subject, local districts are busy creating their own fisheries laws within the framework of the national law. Unfortunately, as Myanmar has been rather isolated during the last two decades, the issues of customary rights, rights to livelihood and the role of the State towards the unorganized sectors are not concepts that greatly influence contemporary debates on legislation. Nonetheless, the parliamentarians

For more

www.apfic.org/uploads/2012_myanmar_legal

A review of Myanmar Fisheries Legislation, with Particular Reference to Freshwater Fisheries Legislation

www.fao.org/fi/oldsite/FCP/en/MMR/profile.htm

FAO Fisheries Profile – The Union of Myanmar

www.ide.go.jp/English/Publish/Download/Vrf/pdf/433.pdf

Trends of Development of Myanmar Fisheries with Reference to Japanese Experiences

A Voice for the Coast

A countrywide consultation was held in Dhaka, Bangladesh, on the proposed FAO International Guidelines on Small-scale Fisheries

A national consultation process on the International Guidelines for Small-scale Fisheries (IGSSF) of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) was recently organized in Dhaka, Bangladesh. The Coastal Association for Social Transformation Trust (COAST) organized the consultation to gather recommendations from stakeholders on the proposed guidelines. The International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) provided financial support, while the International Collective in Support of Fishworkers (ICSF) rendered various resource services.

The consultation was the first of its kind to be held in Bangladesh. National-level programmes on fisheries, especially on small-scale fisheries, with the participation of members of the fisher community, are rare. There are few effective local or national platforms that fishers can use to raise their voices, which is why the Dhaka consultation process was taken as an opportunity to highlight the challenges facing small-scale fishers in the country.

They depend mainly on ponds, *beels* (small water bodies), lakes, canals, rivers and estuaries, which together cover 4.57 mn ha and employ 1.4 mn people. Bangladesh has a coastal area of 2.3 mn ha and a coastline of 714 km along the Bay of Bengal, which is also a great source of fish. About 296 fresh- and brackish-water fish species (including freshwater prawns) and 511 marine species (including shrimp) are available in the waters of Bangladesh. Most of the members of the country's fishing communities are illiterate and poor.

They enjoy few basic civic facilities, are not organized, and are not even aware of their rights as a result of which they are often exploited by moneylenders, musclemen and politicians.

In Bangladesh fishing has traditionally been the occupation of members of the Hindu Jaladas caste. Given the low social status associated with fishing, these communities historically occupied the lower rungs of the social hierarchy in rural communities. Even within the

National-level programmes on fisheries, especially on small-scale fisheries, with the participation of members of the fisher community, are rare.

country's Muslim society, where caste is not recognized, groups traditionally involved in fisheries have been generally accorded a low social status. The problems facing fishing communities in Bangladesh include:

- natural disasters like floods, cyclones, tidal surges and droughts that damage crops and assets;
- social problems like dowry, polygamy, divorce, sexual harassment and land disputes;
- health problems that erode incomes due to unexpected medical expenses for the main wage earners; and
- financial problems resulting from high-interest loans from informal sources of credit, theft of assets like fishing gear and harvest, accidents, death of wage earners,

*This report is by **Md. Mujibul Haque Munir** (munir@coastbd.org), Assistant Director-Food Security and Education Advocacy, COAST Trust, Bangladesh*

MD. TAUHIDUL ALAM



A first-of-its-kind national consultation on the FAO IGSSF was recently held at the CIRDAP Auditorium, Dhaka, Bangladesh

lack of alternative employment opportunities, legal expenses for dispute settlement, and so on.

In recent years, the impact of climate change has been increasingly felt on the small-scale fisheries sector. Fishers are more vulnerable to natural disasters than others of the coastal area as they are the ones who depend primarily on rivers, estuaries and littoral waters for their livelihoods. Coastal fishers contribute to between 22 and 25 per cent of the total fish production of the country, although they are the first victims of natural disasters. Each cyclone or tidal surge kills hundreds of fishers (as happened in 2007 with the super-cyclone Sidr), and force many others to seek out the coasts of foreign countries, where they often face harassment and even imprisonment.

The effects of climate change can be seen in the coastal areas of Bangladesh in the form of sea-level rise (which can destroy mangrove forests and fish nurseries), a reduction of freshwater availability due to salinity intrusion, and an increase in the frequency of cyclones. Increasing salinity affects freshwater fish production, while rising sea temperatures may affect the distribution patterns of some fish species. These days Bangladesh's fishers find it increasingly difficult to fish near the shore, and have to venture into deeper waters.

In the face of natural disasters like storms and cyclones, many small-scale fishermen in Bangladesh have had to abandon their fishing trips in order to safeguard their lives, often losing their fishing nets and boats in the process. A successfully completed fishing trip generally requires about 14 days. If a 'potentially dangerous' Level 3 signal is sent out from a fishing port to warn of extremely rough sea conditions, the fishers, who normally spend 14 days at sea for a complete fishing trip, return to shore and take shelter. In 2007, around 22 warnings indicating a disaster intensity above Level 3 were issued.

Fishing trips that are abandoned during the peak seasons cause a significant erosion of incomes, and drastically affects the livelihoods of fishing communities. Yet there is little support from the Bangladesh government to help the small-scale fishers in crisis. On the contrary, some of its recent policies have been designed to support the large-scale sector, with water bodies being leased out to influential persons rather than bona fide fishermen.

It was in this context that the Dhaka consultation sought to:

- bring together under one roof all government agencies, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and private-sector parties involved in small-scale fisheries;
- develop co-ordination among the groups working with the small-scale fisher community;
- ensure interaction with national-level policymakers on IGSSF, and engage in advocacy for the betterment of the lives and livelihoods of the small-scale fishers of Bangladesh; and
- prepare recommendations on IGSSF and also on how to engage in greater networking and advocacy for sustainable small-scale fisheries in Bangladesh.

Ensuring participation

To realize these objectives and to generate maximum and effective participation of fishers and related stakeholders, COAST organized the

Dhaka consultation in a different manner. To ensure participation from all possible regions of the country, COAST selected five sample regions of fisher communities—one from the coastal area, three from the riverine area (one sweet-water, one mixed-water and one saline-water) and one from a *haor* (a large water body) area.

In each area, two focus-group discussions (FGDs) were arranged with 15 participants in each FGD. Regional workshops were also arranged in each area to validate the FGD findings and to make a wider assessment. To complete the regional-level FGDs and workshops, a national-level workshop was organized in Dhaka with representatives from all the five regions, followed by a seminar to sum up the grass-roots consultations and presentations for the benefit of national policymakers.

A two-day orientation programme was held for the field resource persons in which 25 participants from five regions participated. Of the five from each region, three were small-scale fishermen community leaders and two were NGO officials who led the FGDs and district-level workshops. The regions represented were Bhola, Cox's Bazar, Khulna, Bogra and Sunamganj.

A total of 500 persons participated in the Dhaka consultation—300 fishers, 17 government officials, 19 political leaders, 35 journalists, 26 NGO workers, 40 businessmen, 34 academicians and 29 representing other professions.

One of the key objectives of the consultation was to create an effective platform for the marginalized fishers of Bangladesh and to identify who small-scale fishers are and what comprises small-scale fisheries. The participants defined small-scale fishers as those who earn their living and ensure their livelihoods by capturing fish from rivers and the sea. Other characteristics of small-scale fishers are: social and economic marginalization; the use of small fishing gear and vessels; nearshore (not deep-sea) fishing operations; reliance on open water bodies;

manufacture of vessels and nets on a small scale; and culture and processing of fish with investments of under 40,000 Bangladesh taka (BDT) or around US\$490.

The major problem identified by the participants at the consultation was the lack of legal recognition of fishers or fishworkers in the policies or laws related to the fisheries sector of the country. That was the reason for one of the key recommendations of the consultation—to provide identity cards for small-scale fishers. It was strongly suggested that fisher community members themselves should be asked to prepare the list of bona fide small-scale fishers.

Another major recommendation of the consultation was to search for alternative livelihood or income-generating options, considering that fishing is often seasonal. Financial support should also be provided

The major problem identified by the participants at the consultation was the lack of legal recognition of fishers or fishworkers...

during official fishing embargoes. A social-security net in terms of special quotas for the fisher community members was also demanded. Female members of the community should be trained for employment in fish culture and poultry farming.

Inadequate healthcare services for the fishers was pointed out as a severe problem. Demands were expressed for community clinics and mobile health centres on the rivers and the sea so that fishermen in distress can get free emergency treatment and medicines.

Educational demands

In the sphere of education, demands were made for primary schools in embankment areas, free educational material for the children of fishing communities, and special scholarships to help eliminate child labour.



30

A local Member of Parliament from Sathkhira, Bangladesh, speaking at the regional workshop held to discuss the FAO IGSSF

There are various anomalies in the distribution of *khas* (government land) among the poor. At the consultation, fishers, who are mostly landless, demanded proper distribution of *khas* land.

Considering the power exercised by middlemen and moneylenders on the community, participants also recommended easy access to credit for fisher community members, which would help them access markets better.

Fishers in Bangladesh do not enjoy any health insurance or emergency medical aid schemes. In this context, demands were made for potable water supply, ambulance services and free health insurance.

Cancellation of the leases on open water bodies was strongly recommended to make sure that small-scale fishers enjoyed continuing access to fisheries resources.

Perhaps the most important outcome of the Dhaka consultation was the creation of an organization for the fisher community of Bangladesh, the National Fisher Folk Solidarity Forum. COAST will provide the secretarial and technical support

for the Forum, which is expected to become an effective community-based platform that fishers can use to make their voices heard locally and nationally.

For more

www.coastbd.org

The Coastal Association for Social Transformation Trust

www.coastbd.org/images/stories/events/seminar18102012/English_Press_release.doc

Press Release about the Workshop

www.fisheries.gov.bd

**Department of Fisheries,
Government of Bangladesh**

Flying Fishermen

The fishermen of Lamalera village in Indonesia catch whales in a time-honoured tradition of a subsistence way of life

His sinewy body wrapped in a grey-and-maroon striped *lungi* (a wraparound sarong used by men in south India), he stands out in the crowd of suits and boots at the 11th meeting of COP to the CBD in Hyderabad's Hitech City, the swanky venue for the global bash. He is usually found hovering around a venue where discussions about issues faced by coastal communities are held, and it is easy to place him at first glance as a fisherman. But Bona Beding is no common fisherman. He is one of those 'flying' types, who jumps into the sea with a harpoon to catch big fish. Bona, as he is fondly called by people who know him, is a whaler from Indonesia.

Not being fluent in English does not stop Bona from smiling invitingly at curious passers-by. Though he has Riza Damanik of KIARA, the Indonesian non-governmental organization (NGO), to help with translations, Bona is not intimidated by the English speakers as most non-English-speaking people usually are. In his broken English, he intervenes to correct the speaker if he is referred to as a 'hunter': "I do no hunting. This is not a game." Bona understands the nuances of language, even of a language foreign to him, and will not yield easily. "It is not hunting like it is in Japan or Taiwan. It is a giving from God." That is what the people of his village Lamalera, who catch whales "only to consume within the village and never to earn profits" believe.

Lamalera, situated in the southern part of Lembata Island in the East Nusa Tenggara Province of Indonesia, is populated by around 4,000 indigenous

people. Damanik says, "Many have filmed Lamalera. Its whaling traditions are famous." True to his words, a deluge of websites on the village pop up in any Internet search. One of them is from the pages of the famous National Geographic magazine—a striking picture of a fisherman jumping headlong into sea, caught midair against a coruscating blue noon sky, in a process labelled 'subsistence hunting'. "I don't yet jump

"Fishing is not just an activity. It is a way of life," says Bona.

like that. But my father does. But one day I will overtake my father," says Bona on seeing the picture.

Handover tradition

Bona's father, Stephanus Beding, 74, is the *lamafa*—the captain of the fishing boat. The *lamafa* tradition, akin to monarchy, involves the son taking over the captaincy of a boat from the father. But *lamafa* is not just a leader but also the general. He is the one who takes the plunge into the sea, to battle with the sperm whale. "Fishing is not just an activity. It is a way of life," says Bona. As Damanik ends his interpretation with that brief line, Bona nudges him to add: "It is a philosophy." Listening to Bona outline the tenets of this philosophy, it is difficult not to be convinced that it indeed is a philosophy of living.

This profile is by **Janani R Ganesan** (janani.r.ganesan@gmail.com), a freelance journalist based in Tirunelveli, Tamil Nadu, India

BONA BEDING



Members of the whale fishing community of Lamalera, Indonesia, setting out to sea at the start of the region's whaling season

The fishing community of Lamalera believes that the sea and the land have an intimate connection. Therefore, before the May-October whaling season sets in, the community members begin with a ritual that starts on the top of a hill. Bona claims the existence there of a naturally shaped stone that resembles a whale. The community members offer prayers in front of the stone, and carry a bunch of produce such as fruits and rice from the land to the sea. They drown them as an offering to the sea, which, symbolically for them, is the mother of their village. "We believe that we take from the sea to the land and hence must give from the land to the sea," says Bona.

The fishermen have strict rules about whaling: They do not catch a baby whale or a female whale. They do not go whaling on Sundays, most of them being Christians. Most interestingly, they do not chase a whale beyond a particular point at sea. Bona is unable to pinpoint this in terms of a measure of distance, but he and his clansmen know the boundary by sight, and whales are not to be chased once they cross that limit.

Lamalera's relationship with the sea might seem merely ritualistic, but it runs deeper than that. It has a rather strong correlation with conserving what gives life to the community. Though there are two kinds of

whales in the region—sperm and blue whale—the Lamalera fishermen hunt only the sperm whale because only this species "breeds a lot." The blue whale is considered an endangered species by the international environmental community. But that does not concern the people of Lamalera. They believe they understand their sea better. "But the international community always looks at us from the outside. They never try to get into our community and understand what the sea means to us," says Bona.

In 2009, Lamalera waters were declared a part of the Sawu sea conservation area. The decision was followed by a prohibition on traditional whale capture, which has sustained the community since the 13th century. But strong opposition from the Lamalera community persuaded the government to withdraw the Lamalera waters from the Sawu Sea conservation area.

Mere ruse

"We consider ourselves the owners of the sea. We know that the quality or quantity of whales has not declined. Why would we destroy something we depend upon?" asks Bona. "This marine protection is only a ruse to allow privatization. We will not let that happen in Lamalera," he says. Damanik, whose organization, KIARA, has worked with coastal communities,

adds that the declaration of protected areas throughout the country has been followed by privatization and tourism in those areas.

Damanik puts the process of marine protection in Indonesia in context. To date, 15 mn ha of marine area has been brought under protected areas. By 2020, the Indonesian government aims to increase this to 20 mn ha. Damanik claims that this expansion is mindless as it does not take into consideration the valuable traditional knowledge available with indigenous communities. Sometimes fishermen, who accidentally venture into protected areas, are shot down by coastal guards.

All around the world, the issue of rights over sea territory has seen conflicts. Indian fishermen languishing in Pakistani jails or fishermen from Tamil Nadu shot dead by the Sri Lankan Navy are examples. The situation in Indonesia is no different. The irony, however, is that often the human massacre is the result of a rather contorted battle waged by the State to conserve some species. Since the Aichi Targets adopted by COP10 aims to bring 10 per cent of the earth's coastal areas under protection, governments have been clamouring to reach that number, often overlooking huge losses to livelihoods, and sometimes even life.

Bona opens a digital image on his Macbook. It is of near-naked children lying on the beach, covered in sand. If only they had slightly protruding bellies, and snot or rashes—instead of smiles on their faces, the image would fit the perfect stereotypical caricature of poverty. Bona knows that. He asks: “Do you think these children are poor?” He is not being rhetorical, he demands an answer. “They are happy. In Lamalera everybody is happy. Nobody is rich or poor. I want to be a fisherman. I want my son to be a fisherman. Why do you oppose?”, he asks the conservationists and governments ridden with a development agenda.

Bona is unable to indicate the average income of the Lamalera villager

nor is he able to say if everybody in Lamalera can afford a Macbook like his. A closer look at the village might reveal inequalities, or it might not. Bona says that the Muslims in the village do not fish. Christians and Muslims have different days assigned to sell produce in the market. It is convenient to momentarily forget divisions along religious lines. Utopia does not exist, either in the developed urbane or in the romanticized countryside. But that is not reason enough to not give people a choice. Lamalera wants to fight for that choice, asserts Bona.

Primarily a barter community, the women in the village go to the markets to sell their produce. Fish is traded for other agricultural products. Lamalera seems the idyllic example of a community that sustains itself. From Bona's wraparound sarong to the boat's sail, everything is made from locally available material. Bona hands out a visiting card and says, “The paper is made from a local tree.” It is this way of life that people like Bona want to defend.

In the last three years, spearheaded by Bona, a local festival called *Baleo* (a fisherman's chant when out at sea to catch a whale) is being celebrated as a symbol of the contentment of the community members with their lives.

As part of the cultural programme, a compact disc is handed out to all outsiders, which contains songs about Lamalera—a village whose very name is musical and rolls off the tongue in four syllables, La - ma - le - ra. One of the songs, whose tune is reminiscent of the sway of boats on a calm sea, goes “La, La for Lamalera, the plate of the sun”, a song about the traditions and customs of the village.

Bona plays the song at a seminar and considers it self-contained and sufficient to make the critical point that the villagers of Lamalera know how to respect the sea, what it gives back to them, and how to find contentment in their relationship with it.

For more



vimeo.com/1937097

A Whale Hunt in Lamalera – Indonesia

www.bbc.co.uk/learningzone/clips/sustainable-fishing-lamalera-whale-hunters-in-indonesia/11954.html

Sustainable Fishing: Lamalera Whale-hunters in Indonesia

www.twofourdigital.net/Insight/whale_hunters.wmv.aspx

Indonesia: The Whale Hunters

Small-scale Hopes

A national consultation workshop on sustainable development of small-scale fisheries in Vietnam was held recently in Hanoi

A national consultation workshop on sustainable development of small-scale fisheries in Vietnam, and the international guidelines on sustainable small-scale fisheries proposed by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) was held during 1-2 November 2012 in Hanoi.

The workshop was organized by the Department of Capture Fisheries and Resources Protection

participation in sustainable fisheries management.

Vietnam's fisheries sector plays an important role in the country's economic development, in labour and income generation, and in food security and poverty alleviation, both in urban and suburban areas. There are around 4.7 mn Vietnamese workers in the fisheries sector, involved in capture, aquaculture, fish processing and allied services. In 2011, the country's total fisheries production was 5.2 mn tonnes, and exports of fish products were valued at US\$6 bn, accounting for 24.44 per cent of agricultural exports and 6.34 per cent of total exports.

The Hanoi workshop focused on four primary areas:

- sharing of information on small-scale fisheries in Vietnam, including the roles, issues and challenges relevant to specific human-development needs, fishery-based livelihoods in inland and marine regions, food security, poverty alleviation and sustainable use of fishery resources
- contributing to the proposed guidelines of FAO on small-scale fisheries through the opinions of stakeholders in the context of Vietnam
- strengthening the knowledge and capacity, and improving the roles, of civil society organizations in the development of sustainable fisheries
- enhancing co-operative networks among government agencies and fisheries associations, and creating opportunities to enable them to participate in decision-making processes

The topics covered at the workshop dealt with the challenges that small-scale fisheries and fishers in Vietnam face...

(DECAFIREP) of the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD), in co-operation with the Centre for Marinelife Conservation and Community Development (MCD) and the Vietnam Fisheries Society (VINAFISH), with support from the International Collective in Support of Fishworkers (ICSF).

Sixty participants from national and local authorities, fisheries organizations and associations, non governmental organizations (NGOs) and fishermen representatives attended the workshop.

The topics covered at the workshop dealt with the challenges that small-scale fisheries and fishers in Vietnam face, namely, the lack of financial resources; unstable production; environmental impacts (including from natural disasters and climate change); market-led approaches; and limited

*This article is by **Than Thi Hien** (tthien@mcdvietnam.org), Centre for Marinelife Conservation and Community Development (MCD), Vietnam*

At the Hanoi workshop, participants discussed key issues related to registration and safety, value chain, gender and climate change, and how to improve benefits for small-scale fishers. They also proposed solutions and recommendations for sustainable fisheries management.

Throughout the workshop, participants stressed the importance of small-scale fisheries in terms of policy development. Although Vietnam has in place policies on small-scale fisheries, such as the Fisheries Law and other important legislation, gaps still exist in the implementation of these policies at the local level, which are needed to sustain the communities' livelihoods and protect natural resources.

Emphasizing the significance of the Hanoi workshop for the sustainable development of Vietnam's small-scale fisheries, the MCD presentation on the key policy recommendations led to interesting panel discussions. Tran Cao Muu, General Secretary of VINAFFIS, said: 'Small-scale fisheries play a large role in creating jobs and exploiting coastal resources locally and globally. FAO and Vietnam, therefore, share common concerns about the direction and organization of activities of the sector. In our framework, effective solutions have been raised to ensure civil rights and prevent destructive fishing. Innovation is suggested to rehabilitate coastal resources, help the transition of economic systems, and create a model for the production value chain and co-management that will ensure a more sustainable development of Vietnamese small-scale fisheries'.

According to statistics presented at the workshop, as of 2011, there were around 128,000 fishing vessels in the country, with a total capacity of 6.4 mn vessel capacity units (VCUs), which employed millions of people. Production from the small-scale fisheries sector accounted for about 69 per cent of the total annual fisheries production. Small-scale fishers have targeted species like shrimp, crab, octopus and squid for export.

Chu TienVinh, the former Deputy Director of the General Department of Vietnam Fisheries, said that it was necessary to develop the fisheries sector into one that could produce competitive branded goods of high quality and repute so that the traditional fisheries sector could be transformed into a modern one. Research on environmental resources, and gathering time-series data on coastal fishing activities were the basic inputs needed for production planning in each region. It is also important to re-organize production at sea and develop co-operative models of fisheries management and production, while simultaneously enhancing the role of women in fisheries, it was stressed.

Nguyen Quang Vinh Binh, Vice President of the Fishery Association in Thua Thien Hue province in central Vietnam, where lagoons are located, said: "Fishery associations should have access to fishing rights, so that they are able to manage fishing activities. Fishery associations should re-organize fishing grounds in a way that can sustain the traditional fishing areas of people and families who are members of the association. At the same time, they can facilitate and provide support for fishermen who legally practise fishing in a creative, well-organized and effective

NGUYEN DUC HIEU



Nguyen Thu Hue, Director, MCD, Nguyen Quang Vinh Binh, Vice President, Fishery Association, Thua Thien Hue province, Tran Cao Muu, General Secretary, VINAFFIS, and Chu Tien Vinh, Former Deputy Director, General Directorate of Fisheries, MARD

NGUYEN DUC HIEU



Inaugural session of the national workshop on FAO IGSSF, held at Hanoi, Vietnam, during 1-2 November 2012

36

way. Fishery associations also have the right to eliminate members who repeatedly make serious mistakes in disregarding the rules of the organization or who engage in activities that adversely affect the natural environment and aquatic resources. In the Thua Thien Hue province, there are about 6,000 members organized into 65 official fishery associations. Of those, 22 have been given fishing rights by the district authorities, and about 10,000 ha and seven fishery associations are involved in the management of fishery conservation areas”.

The outcome of the Hanoi workshop is expected to be shared widely in the run-up to the international FAO workshop in Rome in 2013.

For more



www.minrol.gov.pl/eng/

Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, Vietnam

www.mcdvietnam.org

Centre for Marinelife Conservation and Community Development (MCD)

Tug-of-War

***Shifting Undercurrents*, a 20-minute documentary directed by Rita Banerji and produced in 2012 by ICSF, reveals the problems of women seaweed harvesters**

In the genre of social-issue-based documentaries, *Shifting Undercurrents*, a 20-minute film, produced in 2012 by the International Collective in Support of Fishworkers (ICSF), is a welcome addition, dealing with the little-known aspects of life on the margins of development and landscapes. The film seeks to sensitize viewers to the conditions of women seaweed harvesters in the coastal villages alongside the Gulf of Mannar National Park (GoMNP) in Ramanathapuram district of the south Indian State of Tamil Nadu.

The subject of the film is fascinating, dealing as it does with how the politics of livelihood and conservation shifts between the logic of marine and terrestrial landscapes. The subtext that I read into the film was even more intriguing—the challenges, freedoms and ingenuity that the underwater world extracted from the women seaweed extractors of the region. Despite poor underwater visuals, the film provides a first-time glimpse into the form and materiality of seaweed harvesting. The mask and flippers, and the training, knowledge and technologies employed by these women stand in stark contrast to popular images of underwater diving and divers.

The film begins with an established format of tracking the everyday life of its protagonists, instantly taking the viewer into the intimate space of the home and the community through stunning visuals of the coastal space. M. Laxmi, a woman seaweed harvester, sets the context of the fragility of eking a livelihood out of seaweed collection in the waters of

a globally recognized biodiversity area—the Gulf of Mannar.

The film's crisp commentary reveals certain interesting facts: The GoMNP was declared in 1989; around 5,000 seaweed collectors from 25 villages in the Gulf of Mannar depend on seaweed extraction for their livelihoods; and in 2000, the women were expressly forbidden from entering the park and extracting seaweed. Normally, large quantities of seaweed are sent to distant processing centres from where they go to units in

The subject of the film is fascinating, dealing as it does with how the politics of livelihood and conservation shifts between the logic of marine and terrestrial landscapes.

the food-processing industry, which uses the carrageenan extracted from seaweed as a vegetarian alternative to animal-based gelatin.

In the film, the fragility of the women's profession is introduced to the viewer at multiple stages. Working underwater, which involves daily hazards, the women have to deal with two fundamental conditions to draw wages from the seaweed traders who are their paymasters—access to the resource, and a market for it.

Corporate whims

The lives of these women appear to be firmly wedged between the whims of corporate entities like Nestle, Coca-Cola and the Himalaya Drug Company, who are the principal buyers of carrageenan, and those

*This review is by **Aarthi Sridhar** (aarthi77@gmail.com), a PhD student at the Centre for Studies in Science Policy, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi, and a Trustee of Dakshin Foundation, Bangalore, India*

RITA BANERJI



The film focuses on the problems of the seaweed collectors of the Gulf of Mannar after the declaration of a national park

of a conservation regime. The film focuses mainly on the latter theme, drawing attention to a legal conservation framework that alienates the women divers from the waters of the GoMNP.

Created under the Wild Life (Protection) Act, the GoMNP is now under the custodianship of the Wildlife Wing of the Tamil Nadu Forest Department, which appears, at best, duty-bound to implement a

draconian and unimaginative conservation law. The GoMNP could be said to be geographically unhappy in its location adjacent to the coastline of the Gulf of Mannar, which is today dotted with numerous industrial units, commercial ports, harbours and thermal power plants. The pollution caused by these industries, overfishing by mechanized vessels, and the damaging effects of coral mining are now part of the local legend of the environmental degradation of the area. *Shifting Undercurrents* points to the irony of governmental environmental agencies turning a blind eye to the misdeeds of powerful external agencies, even as they unjustly harass the marginalized women seaweed divers.

The film highlights the contrasting narratives that mark all conflict and actors in the area, who occupy opposing poles and have contravening rationales. Laxmi, the seaweed collector first introduced to viewers of the film, points out that the law is oblivious to the realities of the marine life she is familiar with—seaweeds do not grow on live corals; they can indeed be harvested carefully, for which the women have the requisite skills; sustainable harvest of seaweed in a protected area is, therefore, possible; and marine boundaries defy logic.

Shekhar Kumar Niraj, the Director of the Gulf of Mannar Biosphere Reserve, says that seaweed harvesting is not a “foolproof system”, and is faced with another kind of uncertainty—the impacts of a thriving business on coral biodiversity. Such uncertainty and the absence of sufficient scientific evidence is reason enough to restrict seaweed harvest in the GoMNP. Though the film does not offer statements of government officials about the certainty of environmental damage to the area from polluting industries, the implicit message comes through.

The film suffers from some shortcomings. I longed for greater detail on the historicity and political economy of the profession of seaweed harvesting, and the views of the two important sets of actors involved in the GoMNP management process—conservation organizations and scientists. Nonetheless, *Shifting Undercurrents* allows us to explore many of those facets in a fuller fashion. More importantly, it begins many important conversations. Those interested in the tug-of-war between the intractability of the world of legislation and the contest for control over nature's terrain must add this film to their collection. 3

For more

mpa.icsf.net

Marine Protected Areas: Local and Traditional Fishing Community Perspective

www.sunday-guardian.com/artbeat/mannars-notes-from-the-underground

Mannar: Notes from the Underground

Working Together

A collaborative approach to counter illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing is under way in Timor-Leste

Timor-Leste (formerly East Timor, now, officially, the Democratic Republic of Timor-Leste, a sovereign State in Southeast Asia) has established, for the first time, a community-based reporting system on illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing, aimed at addressing problems of IUU and safety at sea, using recently available consumer technology to engage fishers in a mutually beneficial partnership with State institutions.

IUU fishing has been estimated to produce annual losses of between US\$10-23 bn around the world, negatively affecting the environment and livelihoods of many small-scale fishing communities. Most of the IUU fishing in Timor-Leste is conducted by foreign vessels and is concentrated in its southern waters, where enforcement of laws is weak.

As the newest country in the Asia-Pacific region, Timor-Leste faces huge challenges in managing its natural resources, given its budgetary and human-resource limitations. Foreign fishing vessels that illegally operate in the waters off the country's southern coast are well aware of the new nation's lax law-enforcement capacity.

To address this challenge, the National Directorate of Fisheries and Aquaculture (NDFA), in partnership with the Spanish-funded Regional Fisheries Livelihoods Programme for South and Southeast Asia (RFLP), has put in place a community-based IUU reporting system. The community-based IUU programme is very different from the standard vessel monitoring system (VMS) approach.

In the traditional VMS model, transponders are placed on fishing

boats that the government wishes to control. These VMS systems are typically installed on larger commercial boats that are required, by law, to have transponders or have purchased licences or quotas from a country to fish in a specific area.

However, fishers have figured out ways to get around the VMS system, for example, by turning off the system, by leaving it in port and switched on while they go to sea fishing, or putting it on their dinghy or another boat while they go fishing in a restricted area.

Timor-Leste's community-based IUU reporting system takes a different approach, which creates a relationship of trust between artisanal fishers and the State...

On the other hand, Timor-Leste's community-based IUU reporting system, piloted by the NDFA with RFLP support, takes a different approach, which creates a relationship of trust between artisanal fishers and the State, in which artisanal fishers are not seen as targets of control, but are those who control resources in a self-regulatory, non-punitive manner.

Sustainable management

By recognizing their ownership of the resources, they also accept responsibility for the sustainable management of resources, and build their capacity to work with the State institutions, based on mutual respect and common goals. This community-based concept, which was first implemented in Aceh in

*This article has been written by **Crispen Wilson** (conservation@gmail.com), Co-management and Livelihoods International Consultant, RFLP, **Enrique Alonso** (quique@anthroponet.org), Technical Adviser, RFLP, **Pedro Rodrigues** (Petro.Rodrigues@fao.org), National Project Co-ordinator, RFLP, **Mario Pereira** (Mario.Pereira@fao.org), Co-management and Livelihoods National Consultant, RFLP, and **Laurenço dos Reis Amaral** (amaralourenco@yahoo.com), Chief of the General Fisheries Inspection Department, NDFA*

northern Indonesia, with the help of the region's traditional fisheries authorities, the Panglima Laot, was put into operation on a pilot scale in Timor-Leste during February-July 2012. Village leaders were involved in the selection of participants for the project, who were provided with instructions in the local Tetum language.

Initially, two boats operating in the southern waters of the country were loaned the devices. The NDFA has activated seven more devices, which are now ready for distribution. Another 10 will be activated next year, depending on budgetary constraints. Thus, there will soon be over a dozen points along Timor-Leste's coast that can be used to report IUU fishing.

Through reports from fishers in different locations, the authorities involved in maritime affairs have had to revise their operating procedures in order to provide efficient responses; an agreement has since been reached among representatives of the relevant ministries to create a joint body to deal with maritime-security issues, IUU fishing and rescues at sea. The proven system is now in the

activation and maintenance do not require special skills. Extensive satellite coverage allows their use in the most remote places, and is thus a viable option for co-managed control of IUU fishing in developing countries.

The PLB devices automatically transmit their positions every 15 minutes via satellites. The devices have two buttons: one, labelled '911', is for use in the event of a life-threatening or critical situation, to notify emergency-service providers; the second, labelled 'illegal', allows fishers to anonymously report IUU fishing activities, of both foreign and national vessels. (Local IUU fishing issues are normally handled by traditional community systems of conflict resolution, sometimes mediated by the NDFA.)

When the 911 button is pressed, the PLB device sends out an emergency distress signal, giving the boat's location through the same network as the emergency position-indicating radio beacon (EPIRB) system used by boats in the country's western region. The international monitoring centre then sends short message service (SMS) alerts to the cellular phones of the heads of the Maritime Police and Fisheries Inspection departments. Both local and national civil aviation authorities are simultaneously notified of the co-ordinates of the boat in distress.

The 'illegal' button transmits the time, date and position of IUU activity to the Maritime Police and Fisheries Inspection departments. The system ensures anonymity, although staff of the National Directorate of Fisheries and Aquaculture can view the information on a password-protected website.

With these devices, Timor-Leste's artisanal fishers now have a means to call for help if they get into trouble at sea. In exchange for this improved safety, they have agreed to use the devices to report IUU fishing activity in their area to the relevant State authorities in real time.

Database created

As a result, it has been possible to create, for the first time, a database

Timor-Leste's artisanal fishers now have a means to call for help if they get into trouble at sea.

process of becoming a key element in the national monitoring, control and surveillance (MCS) policy of Timor-Leste.

The system hinges on a partnership agreement in which the government loans personal locator beacon (PLB) devices to artisanal fishers. At present, there are only one or two devices per district, which are rotated among the fishers.

These hand-held tracking devices, which are readily available in local electronic shops, are inexpensive, costing as little as US\$100 each, with an annual service fee of approximately US\$150. Their



Children of a fishing community in Timor-Leste, which is currently experimenting with a community-based system to report IUU fishing in its waters

on IUU fishing in the country, with regularly updated maps that also indicate fishing patterns in different areas. The system has also improved communication and trust between fishers and State institutions.

The system is ideal for developing countries such as Timor-Leste which have few patrol boats or extremely limited manpower to patrol remote sea areas. The system could be used to help manage marine protected areas (MPAs) or remote areas that are difficult to access.

For more



www.peskador.org
**National Fisheries Statistics System
 of Timor-Leste**

www.rflp.org/timor_lesle
**Regional Fisheries Livelihoods
 Programme**

Fishing for Answers

A recent study assessed the social and ecological outcomes of government subsidies for small-scale fisheries in Chile

Around the world, small-scale fisheries, because they are often associated with poverty, low levels of income and poor infrastructure, receive substantial support from governmental institutions. Such support may be through specific development programmes, investments in infrastructure, subsidies for vessels

fisheries in Chile offer a useful case study for understanding the relationships between subsidies and production trends. As in many other parts of the world, small-scale fisheries in Chile consist of high-valued resources, and production is, therefore, linked to international markets. Market forces drive the development of small-scale fisheries, stimulating the discovery of resources, developing new markets and influencing prices.

Some subsidies in Chile may be linked to improved management, as in the case of territorial use rights in fisheries (TURFs) in the benthic resources management areas (BRMAs), whose implementation has been greatly subsidized.

Any direct analysis of the influence of subsidies on the number of fishers (or fishing effort) is confounded by a lack of reliable data on the movement dynamics of fishers in and out of fishing-related activities, or along the coast.

Administration

Several instruments and development programmes have been established to deliver these subsidies, which are administered by a number of State institutions such as the Regional Development Fund administered by the regional government offices (the *Regional Intendencias*), the Directorate for Public Works, which has funds for infrastructure, the Fund for Promoting Artisanal Fisheries, the Technical Co-operation Service, the Corporation for Promoting Production, the Solidarity and Social Investment Fund and various private institutions and foundations.

Small-scale fisheries in Chile offer a useful case study for understanding the relationships between subsidies and production trends.

and fish-catching equipment, tax concessions on fuel, income support, and so on.

The provision of such support to the fisheries sector in general is the subject of international debate, sometimes highly polarized and often contentious. In particular, ineffectual management and governance systems tend to be overlooked by those who contend that all subsidies are bad because they promote overfishing and, therefore, ought to be banned. The term 'subsidy' has thus become politically loaded, implying a certain degree of impact on production or trade, which may not necessarily be the case.

In reality, very few empirical studies have explored the outcomes to be expected from subsidies, especially in small-scale fisheries. It is also unclear whether subsidies in small-scale fisheries can have positive outcomes under an effective management regime. Small-scale

This article, by **Brian O'Riordan** (briano@scarlet.be), is based on "An Empirical Analysis of the Social and Ecological Outcomes of State Subsidies for Small-scale Fisheries: A Case Study from Chile" by Carolin I. Mondaca-Schachermayer, Jaime Aburto, Georgina Cundill, Domingo Lancellotti, Carlos Tapia, and Wolfgang Stotz, published in *Ecology and Society* 16(3): 17 2011. (<http://www.ecologyandsociety.org/vol16/iss3/art17/>)

A recent study assessed the social and ecological outcomes of government subsidies for Chile's small-scale fisheries through an analysis of 32 fishing villages, or *caletas*, over a 12-year period (1996-2007) in the Coquimbo Region (Region IV).

A *caleta* is a registered area where fishers land their catches, keep their vessels and gear, and from where they carry out shore-based activities. *Caletas* are also settlements with basic infrastructure, where fishing families live. They may be situated on public or private land. Those situated on private land are legally guaranteed access to fishing grounds. However, no infrastructure, such as piers, can be installed by the government on private land.

The region of the study includes 350 km of Chile's 4,000-km seaboard and is regarded as one of the country's most important small-scale fishery regions. There are 4,809 artisanal fishers in the region who are officially recorded in the artisanal fishery register maintained by SERNAPESCA, the national fisheries service.

Between 1996 and 2007, US\$25.55 mn were spent in the region for over 400 diverse projects and programmes to develop fisheries, improve working conditions of fishermen, and alleviate poverty. The subsidies were distributed for infrastructure and equipment (74 per cent), production (nine per cent), social programmes (15 per cent), research (one per cent) and TURFs (one per cent). The average annual funding of \$2.55 mn represents 48 per cent of the average annual value of regional landings. When considered on a per capita basis, this sum represented 59 per cent of the annual average income of an artisanal fisherman in the region. Additional regional funding initiatives totalled \$9.64 mn during the same period. This funding was targeted at artisanal fishermen but not at specific *caletas*.

According to the study, over three-quarters of the subsidies were spent in just one province, Elqui, where the capital of the region is located. *Caletas* in rural areas received fewer subsidy amounts for

KAROLL VERA



The *caleta* of Guayacán in Coquimbo, Chile. A *caleta* is a registered area where fishers land their catches, keep their vessels and gear, and from where they carry out shore-based activities

port infrastructure than their urban counterparts. The findings showed that subsidies were highest in those *caletas* that recorded the greatest value of landings, and lowest in *caletas* with higher levels of poverty and underdevelopment. Subsidies for roads and schools, and the supply of healthcare, electricity and drinking water, were concentrated in *caletas* closer to urban areas, than in rural areas in dire need of such assistance.

While the subsidies did improve the working conditions of fishermen in *caletas*, they did not have any effect on fish landings. Despite government

The study also disproved the widely held assumption that governments provide subsidies to alleviate poverty and marginality. In this case, funding was skewed towards those *caletas* that reported the highest values of fish, which were landed at centres close to urban areas that are politically important as vote banks. Funds did not go to remote *caletas* in rural areas that suffered from high levels of poverty and underdevelopment.

In conclusion, the study noted that although empirical analyses do not demonstrate the power of subsidies to incentivise greater efficiency in fisheries, “the assumed detrimental effects of subsidies should not be presupposed”. It suggested more empirical study to examine the presumed relationship between subsidies and overexploitation of fishery resources, and to monitor and evaluate the outcomes of subsidies in fisheries.

The study also disproved the widely held assumption that governments provide subsidies to alleviate poverty and marginality.

grants amounting to more than half the per capita income of fishermen, *caletas* dependent on seaweeds, for example, showed a decreasing trend in per capita income, while those dependent on fish and giant squid displayed a stable trend.

The study failed to find any meaningful relationship between per capita share of subsidies and per capita income of fishers. It concluded that marine ecological characteristics, rather than subsidies, influenced fish production. It appears that the government financial grants were thus a consequence of, rather than a reason for, the ecological and productive history of fisheries in the region.

The study's findings thus challenge two assumptions that commonly inform the debate about subsidization in small-scale fisheries: (a) that subsidies are granted to alleviate poverty; and (b) that subsidization will lead to overexploitation and consequent depletion of fishery resources. Also, as the study found out, better working conditions and improved access to fishing grounds and resources need not necessarily translate into incentives for new entrants to move into fishing.

For more



www.ecologyandsociety.org/vol16/iss3/art17/

An Empirical Analysis of the Social and Ecological Outcomes of State Subsidies for Small-Scale Fisheries: A Case Study from Chile

www.oecd-ilibrary.org/agriculture-and-food/an-appraisal-of-the-chilean-fisheries-sector_9789264073951-en

An Appraisal of the Chilean Fisheries Sector

From the Heart

Fishing people of the North, though resilient, continue to face steep challenges in maintaining their livelihoods

In September 2011, over 150 people from 10 States of the United States (US) and seven countries spent four days together in Anchorage, Alaska, at a symposium titled “Fishing People of the North: Cultures, Economies and Management Responding to Change.”

The symposium provided an opportunity for scholars, fishery managers, fish harvesters and others to explore the human dimensions of fisheries and the growing need to include social-science research in policy development. Organized by the University of Alaska Fairbanks’ Alaska Sea Grant Programme, the symposium was a chance for sharing what we have learned about the opportunities and constraints that fishing people in Northern countries encounter in a time of significant environmental, social and economic change.

It was a fitting topic for a conference in Alaska, since Alaska is a fishing State and Alaskans are a fishing people. Recently, the US National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) documented that for the 22nd year in a row, Unalaska/Dutch Harbour, Alaska, has remained the largest commercial fishing port in the US. Kodiak, Alaska, is in the top ten every year, as are a number of other Alaska fishing communities—Sitka, Naknek, Petersburg, Cordova, Homer and Seward. Annually, over 50,000 people are involved in the commercial harvest and processing of seafood in Alaska. Thousands more are harvesting fish for sport, subsistence or personal use. At any point in the year, the vast majority of Alaskans

have some locally harvested fish in their freezers, on their drying racks or in glass jars on the shelves of their kitchens.

But why are fishing people of the North unique? In the North, we fish and hunt for marine mammals in rough, cold weather and dangerous waters; we are used to extremes—short days and long dark nights in the winter, long and intensely work-filled days of the summer. And we face geographic isolation. In Alaska, of the nearly 300 communities in the

...fishing people of the North recognize the value of their unique lifestyle through a strong sense of community...

State, the majority do not connect by land, just by water or air—creating hundreds of small virtual islands. Remoteness makes it difficult to access capital to expand fishing operations, information and educational opportunities, and access the public process and our ability to influence decisions that impact our lives.

Unique value

Yet, fishing people of the North recognize the value of their unique lifestyle through a strong sense of community, an identity that is fundamentally tied to marine resources, the ability to see and experience our natural world on a daily basis, and a sense of independence that cannot be replicated.

*This article is by **Paula Cullenberg** (paula.cullenberg@alaska.edu), Programme Leader, Alaska Sea Grant Marine Advisory Programme, School of Fisheries and Ocean Sciences, University of Alaska Fairbanks*



Keynote speaker Clare Swan, from the Kenaitze tribe of Alaska, and her daughter Bunny Swan, who began the conference with a song about salmon

The Fishing People of the North symposium was organized into a number of themes—human/environment relationships; fishing communities in transition; indigenous and rural knowledge and communities; governance and management issues in the North; and celebrating the lives of fishing people.

Three common threads wove their way through the symposium—the impacts and response to rapid change; linking of local and cultural knowledge with science; and the struggle to develop governance of fisheries that value traditional practices.

Northern fishing people have a long history of being resilient to change. Now, however, change, particularly climate change, is happening at an unprecedented rate in the North, and with globalization reaching even the most remote communities, change now is more extreme, more widely felt and faster paced.

Assessing the vulnerability of a fishing community was the subject of an analysis by Hunter Berns, of Icicle Seafoods in Alaska, and Flaxen Conway, of Oregon State University. They ranked vulnerability in a number of Alaska fishing communities by measuring indicators of social, economic and natural capital. Age of fishing permit holders, education levels, capacity in the community for economic diversity, fleet capacity,

unemployment levels, natural capital such as resource base, and risk levels were used in their assessment. The ranking provided communities with information on risk, available for use in planning for the future.

Svein Jentoft, of the University of Tromsø in Norway, argued that in order to survive in a dynamic world, small-scale fishing communities must merge both the global and the local. They must find a way to balance the need to sustain a community's culture and tradition, while being responsive to global threats as well as opportunities.

Examples of fishing communities effectively adapting to change ranged from fishing behaviour in the rural Alaska village of New Stuyahok to planning for change in the coastal salmon fisheries of Japan. Ikutaro Shimizu, of the Institute of Fisheries Science in Yokohama, Japan, suggested that co-operation between hatchery salmon and wild salmon production could serve to buffer resource highs and lows as would economic strategies such as saving more income now in anticipation of less profitable years to come.

New Stuyahok, an Alaska native community, has integrated technology enhancements in boating and fishing into the villagers' lifestyles by shifting their traditional subsistence patterns away from their downriver camps to operate more centrally from their village.

While some might see this as a loss of traditional ways, Jory Stariwat, a graduate student at the University of British Columbia, argued that, instead, the shift reflects the community negotiating through a dynamic mixed cash/subsistence economy by taking advantage of both seasonal employment opportunities in the village as well as pursuing the subsistence harvest of salmon.

Traditional knowledge

The value of 'local' or 'traditional' or 'indigenous' knowledge linking to Western science was a thread presented at the symposium by a number of researchers and fishing peoples from around the North.

Three tribal communities along Lake Illiamna in Alaska were concerned about the lack of knowledge on freshwater seals in the area. They partnered with Jennifer Burns, of the University of Alaska Anchorage, to collect both traditional knowledge and scientific data to characterize the behaviour of freshwater seals. The data will be synthesized to better understand the role of the seals in the human and lake ecosystems.

Drawn to the conference by the link to indigenous harvest of marine resources, a group of native Hawaiians attended the conference and described, both in words and song, their ongoing efforts to reinstate traditional management practices—codified in the 'Aha Moku' system—on the island of Maui.

Tim Troll, of the non-governmental organization Nature Conservancy, described how traditional knowledge used for mapping subsistence harvest patterns along the Nushagak River, combined with scientific data about salmon runs, gave important information to Alaska native corporations, in planning use of their significant land holdings along the river.

Access to resources and governance of fishing harvests were major topics of presentations and discussion at the symposium. Maria Nakshina, of the Barants Centre for Humanities in Murmansk, Russia, discussed how access to local resources is, for rural people, strongly tied to their sense of belonging to place. She noted that local people's tolerance for illegal fishing, as defined externally through regulation, is situational and depends on the level of engagement someone has with place. She noted that this has been an informal means of negotiating entitlement to fishing resources.

Two presenters reviewed the community development quota (CDQ) programme in Alaska, considered one of the most successful rural-development fishing programmes in the country. Aggie Blandford, of the Western Alaska Community Development Association, discussed

how the programme, which allocates 10 per cent of the Bering Sea groundfish allocation to six associations representing 65 local communities, has served as a powerful tool in development and education in the region. Scott Miller, of NOAA, discussed how the programme has faced the challenge of restrictions on groundfish, which provides revenue to the region, in order to protect salmon, the mainstay of the rural subsistence economy.

Around the world, indigenous people are struggling to attain control of their traditional resources, to use that control to enable a higher standard of living and, at the same time, retain and reinvigorate traditional values, knowledge and beliefs. As Martin Robards, of the Wildlife Conservation Society, noted, national or State/provincial resource law and policies, combined with global markets and economic trends, can make participation in resource industries difficult.

The Fishing People of the North symposium celebrated the lives of fishing people through an evening poster exhibition and reception, a poetry reading session titled "Fishing from the Heart", and a final reception at the Anchorage Museum of History and Art and a tour of the Sailing for Salmon exhibit that documents the sailboat salmon fishery in Bristol Bay from the late 1800s through the 1950s.

A common sentiment among the participants of the symposium was that ensuring many of the traditions of the fishing lifestyles of the North, while working to adapt to change, is critical to the well-being of fishing people. Resolution of questions about governance, climate change and the new global society requires interdisciplinary responses that blend Western science, traditional knowledge and economic and ecological understanding. Fishing people of the North, while known for their resilience, continue to face steep challenges in maintaining their livelihoods.



For more



seagrant.uaf.edu/conferences/2011/wakefield-people/

Sea Grant

www.marineadvisory.org

Marine Advisory Programme

Improvident Law

Legal improvidence has led to fishers in South Africa being denied access to the waters of protected areas

I am called a pirate.” This declaration came from Donovan van der Heyden, a fisherman from South Africa, who was addressing audiences in Hyderabad during the 11th session of the Conference of Parties (COP11) to the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) in October 2012.

‘Pirate’ is the misnomer employed by the South African authorities to refer to someone who ‘steals’ marine resources, van der Heyden explained. But the law that declares his activities

fishing company to fish in the MPA for the next 30 years. The officials reasoned that the company had been given fishing rights before the act was formulated and hence its rights could not be snatched away suddenly. Ironically, though, the officials had no qualms about annulling the fishing rights of the fishers of van der Heyden’s village, who had traditionally enjoyed access to the very same waters.

The coloured people of Hout Bay do not have motor boats to go beyond the MPA to fish; thus, in order to sustain their livelihoods, they have to work on the boats of richer people. In this little village in post-apartheid South Africa, the rich are still predominantly white. “The government has made us work on white people’s boats, forcing us into enslavement once again. This is South Africa’s second wave of apartheid,” says van der Heyden.

Hout Bay is a microcosm of South Africa; people from diverse racial backgrounds reside in the village, which is populated by around a few hundred people. “Because of this representative nature, most research case studies use Hout Bay as a sample,” points out van der Heyden. What goes wrong here is more likely to go wrong elsewhere in the country, he adds.

Fishing for sustenance

“The people from the village fish for sustenance and not for profits, unlike the fishing and tourism industries. The waters beyond the MPA have only a high-priced species of fish. But what can we do with that? We need local fish and lobster to feed on. We

The people from the village fish for sustenance and not for profits, unlike the fishing and tourism industries.

illegal—the Marine Living Resources Act governing the country’s marine protected areas (MPAs)—does not coerce him into abiding by it blindly.

A revised act was mandated in 2000. But the amendment to the original legislation, which was construed during the apartheid regime, did little to change the law’s discriminating characteristic, claims van der Heyden.

The declaration of van der Heyden’s home region of Hout Bay as an MPA was soon followed by the entry of private companies into the no-take zone and permission for recreational fishing and tourism, while the waters of the MPA remained beyond the reach of the fishing community that had been fishing in the area for centuries. The act granted rights to a large

*This article is by **Janani R Ganesan** (janani.r.ganesan@gmail.com), a freelance journalist based in Tirunelveli, Tamil Nadu, India*

SERGE RAEMAERKERS

are not in the fish trade,” explains van der Heyden.

In order to sustain themselves, people like van der Heyden are forced to go to sea at night, which is dangerous even for those who have fished in those waters all their lives. They are also often caught, forced to pay fines and declared as ‘pirates’. Resentment is thus brewing among the fishers.

Led by van der Heyden and without any organizational funding support, the residents of Hout Bay were able to persuade the government to eject the fishing company from the MPA in 2010, which had been operating in its waters for 19 years. “We have continued to fish in the protected waters because that is the only way we can sustain ourselves. The fish population has not been affected in all these years. Isn’t that example enough to prove we are not the cause for depletion of fish stocks?”, van der Heyden asks. “So why not make it legal to fish here and save us from the trauma of being forced to break the law, pay fines and bribe our way through our daily lives?”

Nico Waldeck, who also works with fishermen, shares a similar experience from Ebebaesar, a fishing town in the Western Cape. There, unlike in Hout Bay, the government consulted with the fishing community before declaring a protected zone. But the consultation was superficial, claims Waldeck. “They gave us their tongues and not their ears,” he says, adding that the reservations of the people were never taken into account. Langerbay, a holiday destination, was thrown open to recreational fishing though it was closed for traditional fishing communities. In this case too, the non-protected waters were beyond the reach of traditional fishing boats. “Pesticide effluents from agricultural land adversely affect the marine resources. But that has been overlooked. Only fishers, who fish to sustain themselves, have been targeted,” says Waldeck, indicating the improvidence of the law.

Since South Africa’s fishermen are not well organized in all regions, it is difficult to fight the marine protection law on a national scale. The application



A South African lobster fisherman. Not being in the fish trade, most fishermen depend on local species for their subsistence

of the law also varies from region to region, making it all the more difficult for fishing communities to engage in a united battle.

For more



bgis.sanbi.org/nsba/marineAreas.asp
NSBA Marine Protected Areas

www.environment.gov.za/?q=content/home

Department of Environment Affairs

rd.springer.com/article/10.1007/s00267-010-9499-x

Marine Protected Area Management in South Africa: New Policies, Old Paradigms

WORLD HERITAGE

Indigenous Peoples

At its tenth session, the United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues (UNPFII) made several recommendations.

At the 34th (Brasilia, 2010), 35th (UNESCO, 2011) and 36th (St Petersburg, 2012) sessions of the World Heritage Committee, representatives of the UNPFII were present as observers and provided statements.

The World Heritage Committee developed a vision and strategic action plan for the 40th Anniversary of the World Heritage Convention.

It noted that UNESCO is in the process of preparing a policy with regard to its programmes on indigenous peoples and encouraged these considerations to be included in the theme of the 40th anniversary of the World Heritage Convention in 2012 on "World Heritage and Sustainable Development: the Role of Local Communities".

A specific issue on world heritage and indigenous peoples has been published as World Heritage Review No. 62 to draw the attention of the international community to this important topic.

It is available online in English, French and Spanish at: <http://whc.unesco.org/en/review/62/>.

An international expert workshop on the World Heritage Convention and Indigenous Peoples was held in September 2012 in Denmark, hosted by the Danish Agency for Culture, the Government of Greenland and the International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs (IWGIA) as part of the 40th Anniversary of the World Heritage Convention.

Source: UNESCO
<http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/920>

2013 BIODIVERSITY DAY

Water and Biodiversity

The theme of next year's International Day for Biological Diversity 2013 is "Water and Biodiversity". Water sustains all life on Earth. It is vital for all people and ultimately determines our way of life. Providing and sustaining water for the needs of people around the world is already well recognized as a major challenge for sustainable development in most areas in both developed and developing countries. The ecosystems of our world, but particularly forests and wetlands, ensure that clean water is available to human communities. Water, in turn, underpins all ecosystem services.

Wetlands can help reduce risks from flooding. Restoring soils can reduce erosion and pollution, and can increase water available for crops.

Protected areas can assist in providing water to cities. These are but a few examples of how ecosystem management can help us solve water-related problems.

Water—the source of all life on earth—is a cross-cutting topic and requires partnerships for its management. Solutions to water management issues are included in the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020 and its Aichi Targets.

CLIMATE CHANGE

Shade trees and mangroves: climate change in the South Pacific

The Pacific island nation of Vanuatu is running out of time. The indigenous inhabitants are already suffering from floods, cyclones, coastal erosion and water shortages. And climate researchers say the extreme weather will increase and sea levels will continue to rise.

Most members of the indigenous population depend on natural resources from farming, forestry and fishing. Now climate change is endangering the livelihoods of the islands' inhabitants. Since 2009, Germany has been funding educational measures for politicians and journalists, and has kick-started several projects for the local rural population. On the main island, Efate, for example, new more robust vegetable varieties are being cultivated, as well as shade trees with nitrogen-fixing properties.

Source: Deutsche Welle
<http://www.dw.de/global-3000-the-globalization-program-2012-08-06/e-16106604-9798>

ORGANIZATIONAL PROFILE

Central American Confederation of Artisanal Fishermen (CONFEPESCA)

CONFEPESCA, founded in 1997, is an umbrella organization for various artisanal fishermen's federations in Central America, namely, FENAPESCA (Guatemala, where the organization has its headquarters), FACOPADES (El Salvador), FENAPESCAH (Honduras), FENICPESCA (Nicaragua), FENAPESCA (Panama) and CoopeTarcos (Costa Rica), which has an observer status.

As part of the Central American Integration System (CCSICA), CONFEPESCA undertakes advocacy work on issues of interest for its constituency. It was the first civil society organization to present a position paper on the European Union-Central American Association Agreement, which it followed

up at many meetings and forums.

CONFEPESCA is also involved in managing seasonal fishery closures for spiny lobster in the Caribbean and shrimp in the Pacific Gulf of Fonseca. It has also promoted

Guidelines for Securing Sustainable Small-scale Fisheries. It also promotes development projects for fishermen in its member countries, either on its own or through CCSICA. To aid management at the regional and national levels, CONFEPESCA draws on the expertise of a Technical Body, which consists of fisheries

specialists from each member country. The organization is now involved in a project to collect data on fisheries production in selected fishing communities in the region.

The management board of CONFEPESCA meets at least once a year and its General Assembly mandate is renewed annually. The organization's current chairman is Félix Paz Garcia from Honduras, and the secretary is Cairo Roberto Laguna from Nicaragua.

CONFEPESCA

exclusive artisanal fishing zones, and has drawn attention to the damaging impacts of trawling and intensive shrimp aquaculture on the environment and natural resources.

CONFEPESCA has disseminated the Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries, developed by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), and has participated in discussions on its proposed International

Fisheries and the Right to Food

Excerpts from the report of the United Nations Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food to the 67th session of the UN General Assembly:

1. A general assessment

Global marine and inland fisheries provide food security to millions of people. They do so through two channels. First, fish consumption accounts for 15 per cent of all animal protein consumed worldwide, and this proportion is even higher in low-income food-deficit countries (LIFDCs) (20 per cent), or in certain regions such as Asia (23 per cent) or West Africa (50 per cent). There are at least 30 countries where fisheries contribute over a third of total animal protein supply, and 22 of these are LIFDCs. Second, the fisheries sector provides 54.8 mn people with employment in capture fisheries and aquaculture and an estimated 150 mn people in upstream and downstream activities. In developing countries, many of those involved in fishing are small-scale fishers, and women are strongly represented in this sector, especially in the pre- and post-harvest sector, while many others depend on the revenues drawn from these activities.

Small-scale fishing is a highly labour-intensive and productive sector, although its importance is sometimes underestimated because of the volume of unreported catch and because some of this small-scale fishing is purely occasional, functioning as an essential safety net for coastal communities in times of crisis. Aquaculture has developed rapidly over the past few decades. Between 1980 and 2010, global fish-food production from aquaculture expanded twelve-fold, and it now may provide up to 45 per cent of all fish for direct human consumption. Asia is by far the leading region in this regard, accounting for 88 per cent of all aquaculture production (62 per cent in China alone). The growth of aquaculture has led to a shift of fishmeal feed from livestock farming to aquaculture uses. But recent reports highlight extensive overfishing and negative ecosystem impacts caused by the fish-feed reduction

industry. Policy initiatives, therefore, should reduce the competition between fishmeal and fish-food availability for human consumption, as well as look to encourage direct human consumption of species of smaller fish, and to impose limits on what proportion of these fish can be diverted to fishmeal.

3. The globalization of fishing and licence and access agreements

The fishing industry is increasingly globalized. International trade of fish products has risen from 8 mn tonnes in 1976, with a value of about US\$8 bn, to 57 mn tonnes in 2010, worth an estimated \$102 bn. Roughly 40 per cent of all fish production is traded internationally, which is more than other foods such as rice (5 per cent) and wheat (20 per cent). For many LIFDC/developing countries, fisheries has become an increasingly important, but undervalued, economic sector, both as a source of export revenues and as a source of State revenues from selling access to distant-water fishing fleets. But various new concerns emerge with the globalization of the fishing industry through trade and access arrangements.

First, this trend may lead to decreased fish-food consumption by those who face food shortages and malnutrition; and competition for marine resources increases between populations with widely diverging purchasing power. The growth of export-led fishing may also encourage overfishing, and sharpen the competition for resources between industrial and small-scale fishing, leading to the loss of jobs over time for fishers in the small-scale sector.

Second, although small-scale fishers in developing countries may benefit from the opportunities created by the increased demand in foreign markets, middlemen or fish-processing factories may pay relatively low and only marginally higher (or even the same) prices than those paid by local markets and consumers. Small-scale fishers also generally face considerable obstacles, such as competition from larger firms,

and tariff and nontariff trade barriers, including difficulties in meeting stringent hygiene and sanitation standards demanded by importing countries.

Third, while export-led fishing may result in employment opportunities on foreign vessels, wages and job security in that sector are often poor and dangerous. Recent research has exposed poor, even slave-like, working conditions on many industrial vessels operating illegally in developing coastal countries. Increased trade and licence- and access-related payments can generate revenues for the developing countries concerned. But a number of problems are identified in this respect. Benefit sharing often remains unequal between the coastal (host) States and the flag States of the fishing vessels. There is also considerable under-reporting of catch to host countries, which can lower domestic revenues. And even where licence and access agreements generate substantial revenues for host countries, the poverty-reducing impacts are ambiguous. The wealth generated by commercial fisheries may be concentrated among a small number of business and political elites, or repatriated to other countries, without benefitting the fishers, let alone society at large. Often, most benefits accrue to the exporting firms, and not to improving the food security of the fishers or fishworkers.

4. Protecting small-scale fishers

The FAO Committee on Fisheries (COFI) is currently developing International Guidelines for Securing Sustainable Small-scale Fisheries. The Special Rapporteur welcomes this important initiative. He notes that access rights of artisanal and small-scale fishing communities—over 90 per cent of whom are in developing countries—are protected under various instruments, including the United Nations Fish Stocks Agreement (which requires States to take into account the interests of artisanal and subsistence fishers) and Article 6.18 of the Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries (which recognizes

“the important contributions of artisanal and small-scale fisheries to employment, income and food security” and recommends that States protect the rights of small-scale and artisanal fishers).

However, there are diverging views as to how to ensure such protection. Proposals to clarify and strengthen access rights, through an approach based on transferable fishing quotas, could lead to rent capture by certain actors in a privileged position, which is difficult to reconcile with poverty-reduction objectives, as recognized by the Human Rights Committee. The Special Rapporteur would, therefore, favour instead providing exclusive rights for small-scale fishers in coastal areas or on lakes, as has been done in Cambodia in Tonle Sap lake. He also notes that top-down management strategies have not been benefiting the small-scale sector. Instead, co-management schemes have been more successful in establishing sustainable approaches to managing fishing intensity and ecosystems impacts. Indeed, while some co-management schemes have failed, such failures are often the result of communities not having been sufficiently involved in setting policy objectives or in ensuring that policymaking and evaluation are based on local knowledge of fish and marine ecosystems.

The Special Rapporteur, therefore, favours involving local fishing communities in the design, implementation and assessment of the fisheries policies and interventions affecting them, in accordance with human-rights norms and standards. He also encourages States to (i) regulate the industrial fishing sector in order to protect the access rights of traditional fishing communities; (ii) consider the introduction of exclusive artisanal fishing zones and exclusive user rights to small-scale and subsistence fisheries, where appropriate; (iii) strengthen the position of small-scale fishers in the production chain, for instance, by supporting the formation of co-operatives and supporting them to expand into the high

contd...

...contd

added value stages of the industry; (iv) support fishers groups wishing to access export markets, under conditions that provide decent employment and promote sustainable fisheries management; (v) provide adequate social protection or safety-net interventions to communities who depend on fishing for their livelihoods in order to reduce the need for food-insecure and/or low-income groups to engage in potentially unsustainable subsistence fishing practices in times of crisis; and (vi) take measures that support women's role in the fisheries sector, for instance by ensuring access to credit for women, and providing adequate facilities for them at landing sites.

INFOLOG: NEW RESOURCES AT ICSF

ICSF's Documentation Centre (dc.icsf.net) has a range of information resources that are regularly updated. A selection:

Publications

Contested Forms of Governance in Marine Protected Areas
by Natalie Brown, Tim Gray and Selina M. Stead.
Earthscan/Routledge. 2013.
ISBN 978-0-415-50064-7

Part of the Earthscan studies in natural resource management, this book compares two different forms of governance of MPAs—co-management (CM) and adaptive co-management (ACM)—with special reference to the Cayos Cochinos MPA in Honduras, examining how far it adhered to the principles of CM and ACM in its first two management plans.

Only One Earth: the long road via Rio to sustainable development
by Ferlix Dodds and Michael Strauss with Maurice Strong.
Earthscan/Routledge. 2012.
ISBN 978-0-415-54025-4

This book analyzes what has happened in the 40 years since the Stockholm UN Conference on the Human Environment and how the goal of sustainable development continues after the recent Rio +20 conference in 2012. It reminds us of the planetary boundaries we must all live within and what needs to be addressed in the next 20 years for democracy, equity and fairness to survive.

Videos/CDs

Mi Aldea, Mi Langosta (My Village, My Lobster)
Directed by Joshua Wolff
Written by Brad Allgood, Joshua Wolff and Bil Yoelin
Produced by Brad Allgood

This is the powerful and shocking story of the indigenous Miskito lobster divers along Nicaragua's Atlantic coast who risk their lives diving for the region's most lucrative resource—the Caribbean spiny lobster. Over the past 20 years, hundreds of Miskito divers have died, and thousands have become paralyzed from decompression sickness, a diving-related condition commonly known as “the bends”. Through the voices of Miskito lobster divers and their families, as well as boatowners, captains and doctors, *My Village, My Lobster* tells the story of an industry and a community in crisis.

FLASHBACK

Food First?

Fish is, at one and the same time, both a source of food and income. This is a quintessential characteristic which should be borne in mind while discussing the issue of food security. In fishing communities, on the one hand, there are large numbers who depend primarily on fishing for a livelihood. For them, it is the income from the sale of fish that lets them pay for the bare necessities of life. On the other hand, there are those who rely on farming, fishing or mere gathering from the bush, in order to exist. For the people of such communities, fish is less a source of income than a source of subsistence—often a vital means of partially meeting their daily nutritional requirements of protein.



From the point of view of consumers, in several developing countries there exist underprivileged classes like agricultural labourers, and plantation and mine workers, who bank on fish as a source of cheap protein. This demand for fish is met mostly by domestic or regional trade. In contrast, there are fairly prosperous consumers in developed countries whose culture, habits and dietary preferences, more than anything else, determine the demand for fish. The requirements for this large market are satisfied mostly from imports.

Recent international efforts to address the issue of food security have gone only part of the way. Consider the Kyoto Declaration and Plan of Action on the Sustainable Contribution of Fisheries to Food Security that sprung from last year's International Conference on the Sustainable Contribution of Fisheries to Food Security, as well as the 31st Session of the FAO Committee on Food Security in February this year. They provide only fragmentary approaches on how to effectively address the issue of food security in the context of fisheries.

Both these meetings focused only on supply-side issues. Augmenting supply per se means little to poorer consumers at the household level, unless the increase in supply should translate into better incomes for poorer fishworkers.

Furthermore, concentrating only on the supply side, without in any way restraining demand, could be ultimately counterproductive. This is because the market is the worst enemy of good resource management. The market mechanism invariably proves efficient enough to absorb large quantities of fish and can thus subvert any management measure, however worthwhile.

— from the Comment in SAMUDRA Report No. 14, March 1996

ANNOUNCEMENTS

EVENTS

Sustainable Ocean Initiative (SOI) Capacity-Building Workshop for West Africa

4 - 8 February 2013, Senegal

It will specifically cover: (i) ecologically or biologically significant marine areas (EBSAs), and (ii) integrated marine and coastal area management toward achieving targets 6 and 11 in a holistic manner.

North Pacific Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of Ecologically or Biologically Significant Marine Areas (EBSAs)

25 February to 1 March 2013, Moscow, Russia

South-Eastern Atlantic Regional Workshop to Facilitate the Description of Ecologically or Biologically Significant Marine Areas (EBSAs)

8 - 12 April 2013, Namibia

WEBSITES

<http://community.icsf.net>

ICSF's site on community-based marine and coastal resource management provides information on practices by fishing communities in different parts of the world. The website has an extensive bibliography of over 350 documents, besides articles from ICSF publications and SAMUDRA News Alerts.

Work in Progress

<http://iloblog.org>

Work in Progress is the blog of the International Labour Organization (ILO) where experts share insights about the world of work and the state of the global economy. In a post on “Labour trafficking: a real eye opener”, Beate Andrees, Head of the ILO's Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour, says there are an estimated 21 mn forced labour victims in the world today.



Endquote

The Sea Hold

The sea is large.

*The sea hold on a leg of land in the Chesapeake hugs an early sunset
and a last morning star over the oyster beds and the late clam boats
of lonely men.*

*Five white houses on a half-mile strip of land ... five white dice
rolled from a tube.*

Not so long ago ... the sea was large...

And today the sea has lost nothing ... it keeps all.

I am a loon about the sea.

*I make so many sea songs, I cry so many sea cries, I forget so many
sea songs and sea cries.*

I am a loon about the sea.

*So are five men I had a fish fry with once in a tar-paper shack
trembling in a sand storm.*

The sea knows more about them than they know themselves.

They know only how the sea hugs and will not let go.

The sea is large.

The sea must know more than any of us.

—Carl Sandburg

